

Nos. 18-1323 & 18-1460

In The Supreme Court of the United States

JUNE MEDICAL SERVICES LLC, ET AL.,
Petitioners-Cross-Respondents,

v.

**REBEKAH GEE, SECRETARY, LOUISIANA
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HOSPITALS,**
Respondent-Cross-Petitioner.

On Writs of Certiorari to the
United States Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit

**AMICUS BRIEF OF THE AMERICAN CENTER
FOR LAW AND JUSTICE, THE AMERICAN
ACADEMY OF MEDICAL ETHICS, AND THE
AMERICAN COLLEGE OF PEDIATRICIANS IN
SUPPORT OF RESPONDENT-CROSS-
PETITIONER**

THOMAS P. MONAGHAN	JAY ALAN SEKULOW
FRANCIS J. MANION	<i>Counsel of Record</i>
CECE HEIL	STUART J. ROTH
GEOFFREY R. SURTEES	COLBY M. MAY
AMERICAN CENTER FOR	WALTER M. WEBER
LAW & JUSTICE	AMERICAN CENTER FOR
1000 Regent University	LAW & JUSTICE
Drive	201 Maryland Avenue, NE
Virginia Beach, VA 23464	Washington, DC 20002
(757) 226-2489	(202) 546-8890
	sekulow@aclj.org

Counsel for Amici Curiae

QUESTION PRESENTED

Given the centrality of maternal health arguments in this case, should this Court keep in mind that the assumption that abortion is generally safe, even safer than childbirth, is unsupported and almost certainly incorrect?

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
QUESTION PRESENTED	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iv
INTEREST OF AMICI	1
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT	2
ARGUMENT	2
I. ABORTION IS A POTENTIALLY HAZARDOUS PROCEDURE	3
A. Ambulance calls	3
B. Maternal abortion deaths	9
II. THE CLAIM THAT ABORTION IS SAFER THAN CHILDBIRTH IS A MYTH	12
A. Relevance to abortion jurisprudence	12
B. Repetition of the myth	13
C. Refutation of the myth and possible backpedaling	15
D. Dissecting the myth	16
E. Response to contrary statements in <i>Whole Woman's Health</i> & District Court findings ...	23
III. PUBLISHED LITERATURE INDICATES THAT, IF ANYTHING, ABORTION IS <i>MORE DANGEROUS THAN CONTINUED</i> PREGNANCY	26

CONCLUSION	31
APPENDIX A: Documented ambulance calls	
2009-19	1a
APPENDIX B: Correspondence with HHS/CDC .	65a

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	<u>Page</u>
CASES	
<i>City of Akron v. Akron Ctr. For Reprod. Health</i> , 462 U.S. 416 (1983)	12, 17
<i>McCormack v. Hiedeman</i> , 694 F.3d 1004 (9 th Cir. 2012)	14
<i>McCullen v. Coakley</i> , 573 U.S. 464 (2014)	7
<i>Planned Parenthood v. Casey</i> , 505 U.S. 833 (1973)	12, 30
<i>Planned Parenthood of Greater Tex. Surgical Health Servs. v. Abbott</i> , 748 F.3d 583 (5 th Cir. 2014)	7
<i>Pleasant Grove City v. Summum</i> , 555 U.S. 460 (2009)	1
<i>ProMedica Health Sys. v. FTC</i> , 749 F.3d 559 (6 th Cir. 2014)	14
<i>Roe v. Wade</i> , 410 U.S. 113 (1973)	12, 17
<i>Whole Woman’s Health v. Hellerstedt</i> , 136 S. Ct. 2292 (2016)	1, <i>passim</i>

OTHER AUTHORITIES

- “Abortion is very safe and is at least 10 times safer than childbirth,” *National Abortion Federation*, <https://prochoice.org/faq-items/abortion-is-much-more-dangerous-than-childbirth/> (Mar. 29, 2014) 13
- Amicus Brief of American Center for Law & Justice *et al.*, *Whole Woman’s Health v. Hellerstedt*, No. 15-274 (Feb. 2, 2016), <https://tinyurl.com/WWH-ACLJ-Amicus> . . 15, 16
- AP, “NY doctor pleads guilty to negligent homicide in botched abortion procedure that killed woman,” *NY Daily News* (May 5, 2018) 9
- “Authorities: Woman died from abortion complications,” *USA Today* (Feb. 21, 2013) . . . 11
- Susan Berry, “Woman Dead After Late-Term Abortion in New Mexico,” *Breitbart News* (Aug. 23, 2017) 9
- Byron Calhoun, *Systematic Review: The maternal mortality myth in the context of legalized abortion*, 80 *The Linacre Q.* 264 (2013) 17
- “The CDC’s Abortion Death Numbers, and What They Mean,” *RealChoice* (Aug. 8, 2012), <https://tinyurl.com/RealChoiceCDCAbDthCount> 22
- CDC, “Abortion Surveillance – United States, 2016,” <https://tinyurl.com/CDCAbortionSurveillance> 19, 22

- CDC, “Pregnancy Mortality Surveillance System,”
<https://tinyurl.com/CDCPregMortality> 18, 19
- “The CDC Report and Abortion Deaths,” ClinicQuotes
 (Aug. 29, 2012), [https://clinicquotes.com/
 the-cdc-report-and-abortion-deaths/](https://clinicquotes.com/the-cdc-report-and-abortion-deaths/) 22
- Jessica Chasmar, “4 Maryland abortion clinics
 shut down, 3 doctors suspended,”
The Washington Times (June 6, 2013) 10
- Priscilla K. Coleman *et al.*, “Reproductive history
 patterns and long-term mortality rates: a
 Danish, population-based record linkage study,”
23 Eur. J. Pub. Health 569, 569 (2012) 28
- Priscilla Coleman, “A Serious Misrepresentation
 of the Relative Safety of Induced Abortion
 Compared to Childbirth Published in a
 Leading Medical Journal,” *We Care*,
<https://tinyurl.com/Coleman-Critique-R-G> 16
- Priscilla K. Coleman, *et al.*, “Substance use among
 pregnant women in the context of previous
 reproductive loss and desire for current
 pregnancy,” *10 British J. Health Psychol.* 255
 (2005) 29
- Cplt., *Davis v. Mark*, No. 19-0119H (Suffolk
 Superior Ct. Jan. 14, 2019),
<https://tinyurl.com/Davis-v-Mark-Cplt> 8

- “Current Trends Ectopic Pregnancy – United States, 1990-92,” *CDC Morbidity & Mortality Wkly. Rep.: Surveillance Summaries*, Jan. 27, 1995, www.cdc.gov/mmwr/preview/mmwrhtml/00035709.htm 20
- Michael J. Feeney, *et al.*, “Queens clinic A1 Medicine probed after Alexandra Nunez is fatally injured while undergoing abortion,” *NY Daily News* (Jan. 26, 2010) 11
- Letter of Louise Gerberding, Director, Centers for Disease Control (July 20, 2004) 25
- Mika Gissler, *et al.*, “Methods for identifying pregnancy-related deaths: population-based data from Finland 1987-2000,” 18 *Paediatric & Perinatal Epidemiology* 448 (2004) 22
- Mika Gissler, *et al.*, “Pregnancy-associated deaths in Finland 1987-1994 – definition problems and benefits of record linkage,” 76 *Acta Obstetrica et Gynecologica Scandinavica* 651 (1997) 26
- Mika Gissler, *et al.*, “Suicides after pregnancy in Finland: 1987-94: register linkage study,” 313 *British Med. J.* 1431 (1996) 28
- Justin D. Heminger, “Big Abortion: What the Antiabortion Movement Can Learn from Big Tobacco,” 54 *Cath. U.L. Rev.* 1273 (2005) 30
- “How safe is an in-clinic abortion?” *Planned Parenthood*, <https://tinyurl.com/PPcurrent> 16

“In-Clinic Abortion Procedures,” <i>Planned Parenthood</i> , https://tinyurl.com/PP-Apr-2016	15
International Planned Parenthood Federation, “How to talk about abortion: a guide to rights-based messaging” (2015) https://tinyurl.com/IPPF2015Guide	14
International Planned Parenthood Federation, “How to talk about abortion: A rights-based messaging guide” (2018) https://tinyurl.com/IPPF2018Guide	14
“Is abortion safe?” <i>Planned Parenthood</i> , https://tinyurl.com/PPAbSafeTeens	13
E. Karalis, <i>et al.</i> , “Decreasing mortality during pregnancy and for a year after while mortality after termination of pregnancy remains high: a population-based register study of pregnancy- associated deaths in Finland 2001-2012,” 124 <i>BJOG</i> 1115 (2017)	27
Chelsea Kiene, “Jennifer McKenna-Morbelli Death: Pro-Life Group Demands Justice After Abortion-Related Passing,” <i>Huffington Post</i> (Feb. 12, 2013)	11
“Medical and Social Health Benefits Since Abortion Was Made Legal in the U.S.,” <i>Planned Parenthood</i> , https://tinyurl.com/PPAbSafe	1

Steve Miller, “Documents Shed Light On Woman’s Death After Abortion,” <i>CBS Chicago</i> (July 24, 2012), http://chicago.cbs.local.com/2012/07/24/documents-shed-light-on-womans-death-after-abortion/	11
Christopher L. Morgan, <i>et al.</i> , “Mental health may deteriorate as a direct effect of induced abortion,” 314 <i>British Med. J.</i> 902 (Mar. 22, 1997)	28
National Academies of Science, “The Safety and Quality of Abortion Care in the United States” (2018)	14, 16
“Notice of Current Violations, Imposition of Administrative Penalty Under State Regulations,” Md. Dep’t of Health and Mental Hygiene (Mar. 26, 2013), https://tinyurl.com/BaltDHMHNotice	10
Operation Rescue, “Autopsy Report Reveals Abortion Patient’s Hemorrhage Not Detected in Time” (July 1, 2014), https://tinyurl.com/Lakisha-AutopRev	10
Operation Rescue, “Carhart Patient Dead From Horrific 33-Week Abortion Injuries” (Feb. 8, 2013), https://tinyurl.com/CarhartPtDth	8
Order for Approval of Wrongful Death Settlement, <i>Jones v. Planned Parenthood of Ill.</i> , No. 2013 L 000076 (Cook Cty. Cir. Ct. L. Div. Jan. 24, 2014), https://tinyurl.com/TReavesSettlem . . .	11
Orwell, <i>Politics and the English Language</i> (1946) .	15

Rosemary Parker, “Dead woman’s ultrasound showed clot, problems after abortion, records show,” *Mlive.com* (Apr. 13, 2017) 10

Karen Pazol, et al., Abortion Surveillance – United States, 2010, *CDC Morbidity & Mortality Wkly. Rep.: Surveillance Summaries* (Nov. 29, 2013), <https://tinyurl.com/CDC-Pazol> 18

“Physical effects of abortion: Fact sheets, news, articles, links to published studies and more,” *The UnChoice*, www.theunchoice.com/physical.htm 30

Pregnancy Mortality Surveillance System, CDC, <https://tinyurl.com/CDCPregMortality> 19

The Pro-Choice Death List, www.safeandlegal.com/the-pro-choice-death-list/ 9

Elizabeth G. Raymond & David A. Grimes, *The comparative safety of legal induced abortion and childbirth in the United States*, 119 *Obstet. Gynec.* 215 (2012) 16, 24

Letter of Batool Raza, Assistant General Counsel, Boston Public Health Commission (May 14, 2019) 7

David C. Reardon, “Abortion Decisions and the Duty to Screen: Clinical, Ethical and Legal Implications of Predictive Risk Factors of Post-Abortion Maladjustment,” 20 *J. Contemp. Health L. & Pol’y* 33 (2003) . . . 29

- David C. Reardon, “The abortion and mental health controversy: A comprehensive literature review of common ground agreements, disagreements, actionable recommendations, and research opportunities,” *SAGE Open Med.* (Oct 29 2018), <https://tinyurl.com/RevAbMentalHlth> 29
- David C. Reardon & Phillip G. Ney, “Abortion and Subsequent Substance Abuse,” *26 Am. J. Drug & Alcohol Abuse* 61 (2000) 29
- David C. Reardon, “The Cover-Up: Why U.S. Abortion Mortality Statistics Are Meaningless,” *8 The Post-Abortion Review* (Apr.-June 2000) . 22
- David C. Reardon, *et al.*, “Deaths Associated with Abortion Compared with Childbirth – A Review of New and Old Data and the Medical and Legal Implications,” *20 J. Contemp. Health Law & Pol’y* 279 (2004) . . 22, 30
- David C. Reardon, *et al.*, “Deaths associated with pregnancy outcome: A record linkage study of low income women,” *95 So. Med. J.* 834 (2002) 27
- David C. Reardon & John M. Thorp, “Pregnancy associated death in record linkage studies relative to delivery, termination of pregnancy, and natural losses: A systematic review with a narrative synthesis and meta-analysis,” *SAGE Open Med.* (Nov 13, 2017), <https://tinyurl.com/RecordLinkageReview> 28

- David Reardon, “Rebuttal of Raymond and Grimes”
(Aug. 2012), <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6027034/> 17
- David C. Reardon & Priscilla K. Coleman, “Short
and long term mortality rates associated with
first pregnancy outcome: Population register
based study for Denmark 1980-2004,”
18 Med. Sci. Mon. 71 (2012) 27
- David C. Reardon, *et al.*, “Substance use associated
with unintended pregnancy outcomes in the
National Longitudinal Survey of Youth,”
26 Am. J. Drug & Alcohol Abuse 369 (2004) . . . 29
- “Safety of Abortion,” National Abortion Federation
(2006), <https://tinyurl.com/NAFAbSafety> 13
- Vanitha N. Sivalingam *et al.*, “Diagnosis and
management of ectopic pregnancy,” *37 J. Fam.
Plann. Reprod. Health Care* 231 (2011) 21
- Statement of Cuyahoga County Medical Examiner’s
Office, <https://tinyurl.com/Lakisha-Med> 10
- Cheryl Sullenger, “18 Year-Old Dies After Botched
Legal Abortion, Found Face Down Foaming
at the Mouth,” *LifeNews* (July 12, 2018) 10
- Cheryl Sullenger, “Autopsy Confirms Abortion
Clinic Killed Young Woman in Botched
Legal Abortion,” *LifeNews* (Sept. 23, 2019) 9

Cheryl Sullenger, “Court Records Indicate Nearly
1,000 Abortion Patients Likely Hospitalized
Annually in Texas” *Operation Rescue*
(Apr. 22, 2014) 8

Cheryl Sullenger, “One Hour From Death:
Abortion Patient Warns of Incompetence,
Squalor at North Carolina Abortion Mill,”
Operation Rescue (Nov. 2, 2015) 8

Cheryl Sullenger, “Planned Parenthood Injures
Woman in Botched Abortion, Downplays
Uncontrolled Bleeding to 911,” *LifeNews*
(Nov. 12, 2019) 7

Cheryl Sullenger, “Woman Found Lying in Blood
on Operating Table After Botched Abortion
Dismembers Her 18-Week-Old Twins,”
LifeNews (Oct. 7, 2019) 7

Scott Taylor, “Woman dies after being rushed to
hospital following an abortion,” *Cleveland*
19 News (Apr. 1, 2014) 10

John M. Thorp, Jr., “Public Health Impact of Legal
Termination of Pregnancy in the US: 40 Years
Later,” 2012 *Scientifica* 1 26

“Women’s Stories from the 2000s,” *Cemetery of
Choice*, [http://www.cemeteryofchoice.com/
The%202000s.html](http://www.cemeteryofchoice.com/The%202000s.html) 11

“Women’s Stories from the 2010s,” *Cemetery of
Choice*, [http://www.cemeteryofchoice.com/
The%202010s.html](http://www.cemeteryofchoice.com/The%202010s.html) 11

INTEREST OF AMICI¹

The American Center for Law and Justice (“ACLJ”) is an organization dedicated to the defense of constitutional liberties secured by law, including the defense of the sanctity of human life. ACLJ attorneys have appeared frequently before this Court as counsel for parties, *e.g.*, *Pleasant Grove City v. Sumnum*, 555 U.S. 460 (2009), or for amici, *e.g.*, *Whole Woman’s Health v. Hellerstedt*, 136 S. Ct. 2292 (2016), addressing a variety of issues.²

The American Academy of Medical Ethics (AAME) was founded to protect and promote the historic values that have provided the longstanding foundation for western medical care. The AAME is a dba of the Christian Medical & Dental Associations, which have over 19,000 members. The AAME comprises doctors, residents, medical students and associate healthcare professionals that subscribe to the traditional values of the Hippocratic Oath.

The American College of Pediatricians is a national nonprofit organization of pediatricians and other healthcare professionals seeking to ensure that all

¹ The parties in this case have filed blanket consents for amicus briefs. No counsel for any party authored this brief in whole or in part. No person or entity aside from amici, their members, or their counsel made a monetary contribution to the preparation or submission of this brief.

² This brief is also filed on behalf of more than 202,500 supporters of the ACLJ as an expression of their support for common-sense safety standards for abortions.

children reach their optimal physical and emotional health and well-being.

The present amicus brief addresses the widely trumpeted, but surprisingly unsupported, misconception that abortion has been proven to be safe and routine, even safer than childbirth.

SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT

This case addresses the constitutionality of abortion facility safety regulations. It is essential, therefore, that this Court understand that abortion, as currently practiced in the United States (and other developed nations), is often the occasion of medical mishaps, even serious injuries and deaths. In particular, the assertion that abortion is somehow safer than childbirth – an assertion echoed in this Court’s *Whole Woman’s Health* opinion – is an unsupported myth, contrary to sound, published medical evidence.

That last statement merits repetition: The claim that abortion is safer than childbirth is a *myth*, resting on demonstrably flawed premises and refuted by study after study.

ARGUMENT

No one expects to see an ambulance pulling away from a dermatology or dental office. Yet ambulances are a not uncommon sight at abortion facilities. This sorry fact is just one of many that belie the abortion industry myth that abortion is safe and routine, even safer than childbirth. As demonstrated below, abortion in fact is a

hazardous procedure that all too often results in serious complications. Moreover, the common claim of abortion advocates that abortion is safer than childbirth is based upon incomplete data and flagrantly inapt comparisons. The published medical evidence strongly suggests that abortion is *more* dangerous, not less, than childbirth.

I. ABORTION IS A POTENTIALLY HAZARDOUS PROCEDURE.

Petitioners June Medical Services *et al.* allege that “[l]egal abortion is one of the safest procedures in medical practice.” JA 20 (Am. Cplt. ¶ 20). This is false.

A. Ambulance calls

People who visit a dentist, eye doctor, dermatologist, or ear/nose/throat specialist do not typically leave in an ambulance. Yet that is a frighteningly common occurrence at abortion facilities. Here is a partial list of *documented* incidents *from 2019 alone* in which an ambulance was called to transport a patient from an abortion facility:³

Jan. 12, 2019, Aurora, IL (incl. 911 call & police report)

Jan. 18, 2019, St. Louis, MO

³ A list of documented incidents from 2009 through 2019, citing sources, is included as Appendix A to this brief. The list presented here in the text omits the source references but notes whether the source includes a recording of the 911 call and/or a video of the incident. Both lists exclude incidents that were not published online or for which the exact date could not be ascertained.

Jan. 24, 2019, Grand Rapids, MI (incl. 911 call)
Jan. 25, 2019, Austin, TX (incl. 911 call)
Jan. 29, 2019, Chicago, IL (incl. 911 calls)
Jan. 30, 2019, Bakersfield, CA (incl. video)
Feb. 4, 2019, Boston, MA (incl. link to public records response)
Feb. 7, 2019, Southfield, MI (incl. 911 call & link to patient care record)
Feb. 7, 2019, Dayton, OH (incl. 911 call and link to EMS report)
Feb. 16, 2019, New York, NY
Feb. 23, 2019, Chicago, IL
Mar. 6, 2019, Peoria, IL (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)
Mar. 6, 2019, New York, NY
Mar. 7, 2019, Dayton, OH (incl. 911 call, video, and link to incident report)
Mar. 12, 2019, Aurora, IL (incl. 911 call & link to police report)
Mar. 13, 2019, Dallas, TX (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)
Mar. 15, 2019, Baton Rouge, LA
Mar. 16, 2019, Detroit, MI
Mar. 21, 2019, Chicago, IL
Mar. 22, 2019, Southfield, MI (incl. 911 call and link to 911 records)
Mar. 27, 2019, New York, NY
Mar. 29, 2019, New York, NY
Mar. 29, 2019, Little Rock, AR (incl. 911 call)
Apr. 2, 2019, Boulder, CO (incl. video & link to CAD report)
Apr. 4, 2019, New York, NY

Apr. 5, 2019, Cleveland, OH (incl. video & 911 call, plus link to report)
Apr. 17, 2019, Cleveland, OH (incl. 911 call and link to CAD report)
Apr. 20, 2019, Boston, MA (incl. link to public records response)
Apr. 23, 2019, Boston, MA (incl. link to public records response)
Apr. 24, 2019, St. Louis, MO
Apr. 25, 2019, Detroit, MI
Apr. 26, 2019, St. Louis, MO
Apr. 30, 2019, New York, NY
May 10, 2019, Philadelphia, PA (incl. video)
May 11, 2019, Hempstead, NY
May 11, 2019, Greensboro, NC (video & 911 call)
May 14, 2019, Walnut Creek, CA (incl. 911 call)
May 15, 2019, St. Louis, MO
May 31, 2019, Chicago, IL (incl. 911 call)
June 7, 2019, New York, NY (incl. video)
June 11, 2019, Providence, RI (video & 911 call)
June 14, 2019, Chicago, IL
June 25, 2019, Chicago, IL (incl. 911 call)
July 16, 2019, Tacoma, WA
July 31, 2019, Chicago, IL (incl. 911 call)
July 31, 2019, Wichita, KS (incl. video, 911 call, and link to CAD report)
Aug. 1, 2019, New York, NY
Aug. 6, 2019, Beverly Hills, CA (incl. links to CAD report, incident report, and EMS report)
Aug. 14, 2019, St. Paul, MN (incl. video)
Aug. 16, 2019, St. Paul, MN
Aug. 17, 2019, Bronx, NY

Aug. 22, 2019, New York, NY (incl. video)
Aug. 28, 2019, Austin, TX (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)
Sept. 7, 2019, Chicago, IL (incl. 911 call)
Sept. 11, 2019, Beverly Hills, CA (911 call)
Sept. 14, 2019, Cleveland, OH (incl. video & link to CAD report)
Sept. 21, 2019, Cherry Hill, NJ (incl. 911 call)
Sept. 25, 2019, Cleveland, OH (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)
Sept. 27, 2019, Jacksonville, FL (incl. 911 call and link to CAD report)
Sept. 28, 2019, Miami, FL (incl. video & link to CAD report)
Oct. 2, 2019, Baltimore, MD (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)
Oct. 3, 2019, New York, NY
Oct. 5, 2019, New York, NY
Oct. 7, 2019, New York, NY
Oct. 30, 2019, Chicago, IL (911 call)
Nov. 14, 2019, New York, NY
Nov. 14, 2019, Cherry Hill, NJ (incl. 911 call)
Nov. 16, 2019, Aurora, IL
Nov. 19, 2019, Chicago, IL
Nov. 21, 2019, Providence, RI
Nov. 21, 2019, St. Louis, MO
Dec. 19, 2019, Fairview Heights, IL

There is every reason to believe this list is just the tip of the iceberg. The news media do not, as a rule, report on medical emergencies at abortion facilities. Documentation of such occurrences therefore is almost

exclusively done by pro-life investigators or by demonstrators or sidewalk counselors who witness and report an incident.⁴ Regarding the latter, documentation occurs only if (1) such persons are present outside abortion facilities, (2) such persons remain there long enough to be present when complications begin to arise (possibly many hours after the pregnant women entered the facilities), (3) such persons witness (or record) the incident, (4) such persons report the incident to some entity with a media platform, and (5) that entity publishes an account of the incident.⁵ It is therefore logical to conclude that the incidents reported markedly understate the actual number of incidents in which abortion patients require emergency transport. *See, e.g.*, Letter of Batool Raza, Ass't General Counsel, Boston Public Health Comm'n (May 14, 2019) (responding to public records request with report of 10 ambulance calls to one particular abortion facility over one-year period);⁶ *Planned Parenthood of Greater Tex. Surgical Health*

⁴ *See McCullen v. Coakley*, 573 U.S. 464, 472-73 (2014) (distinguishing between protesters and sidewalk counselors).

⁵ The list for 2019 is also doubtless incomplete because of the lag time between an incident and discovery and/or publication of any report of that incident. *E.g.*, Cheryl Sullenger, "Planned Parenthood Injures Woman in Botched Abortion, Downplays Uncontrolled Bleeding to 911," *LifeNews* (Nov. 12, 2019) (reporting Jan. 25, 2019 incident nearly ten months afterward); Cheryl Sullenger, "Woman Found Lying in Blood on Operating Table After Botched Abortion Dismembers Her 18-Week-Old Twins," *LifeNews* (Oct. 7, 2019) (reporting on incident two months afterwards).

⁶ <https://tinyurl.com/Boston-records>. Not one of these incidents had previously been reported, so far as amici are aware.

Servs. v. Abbott, 748 F.3d 583, 595 (5th Cir. 2014) (“During these proceedings, Planned Parenthood conceded that at least 210 women in Texas annually must be hospitalized after seeking an abortion”); Cheryl Sullenger, “Court Records Indicate Nearly 1,000 Abortion Patients Likely Hospitalized Annually in Texas,” *Operation Rescue* (Apr. 22, 2014), <https://tinyurl.com/TexasER>.

Moreover, not all serious complications in the aftermath of abortion manifest themselves quickly enough to result in ambulance transport from the abortion facility itself. A patient at a Maryland abortion facility, for example, was transported after the fact, by her family, to an emergency room; she subsequently died. *Operation Rescue*, “Carhart Patient Dead From Horrific 33-Week Abortion Injuries” (Feb. 8, 2013), <https://tinyurl.com/CarhartPtDth>. A woman who had an abortion at a Boston Planned Parenthood thereafter suffered “pronounced and constant” bleeding, which “included clots as large as a baseball,” made two trips to the ER, and ultimately learned that “about 3/4 of the fetus had been retained” in her womb. Cplt., Ex. A at 2-3, *Davis v. Mark*, No. 19-0119H (Suffolk Superior Ct. Jan. 14, 2019), <https://tinyurl.com/Davis-v-Mark-Cplt>. Another post-abortion woman had her mother take her to the hospital after she went home; she apparently came within an hour of dying from internal bleeding. Cheryl Sullenger, “One Hour From Death: Abortion Patient Warns of Incompetence, Squalor at North Carolina Abortion Mill” *Operation Rescue* (Nov. 2, 2015), <https://tinyurl.com/NC-ER1hr>.

The long list of ambulance transfers, Appendix A, while plainly very incomplete, suggests the regularity of serious complications associated with abortion.

B. Maternal abortion deaths

As noted, abortion can lead to the subsequent death of the woman. *See, e.g., The Pro-Choice Death List*, www.safeandlegal.com/the-pro-choice-death-list/ (listing over 250 women who died from abortion).⁷ Some examples of women who have died after abortions include:

- Tia Parks, a 26-year-old who died after an abortion in Cleveland, *see* Cheryl Sullenger, “Autopsy Confirms Abortion Clinic Killed Young Woman in Botched Legal Abortion,” *LifeNews* (Sept. 23, 2019) (with link to autopsy report)
- Jamie Lee Morales, a 30-year-old who died after an abortion in Queens, *see* AP, “NY doctor pleads guilty to negligent homicide in botched abortion procedure that killed woman,” *NY Daily News* (May 5, 2018);
- Keisha Marie Atkins, a 23-year-old who died after an abortion in Albuquerque, *see* Susan Berry, “Woman Dead After Late-Term Abortion in New Mexico,” *Breitbart News* (Aug. 23, 2017) (with link to autopsy report);

⁷ The cited list is by no means complete. For example, it does not include Lakisha Wilson or Maria Santiago, despite the notoriety of their deaths, *see infra*.

- Cree Erwin, a 24-year-old who died after an abortion in Kalamazoo, *see* Rosemary Parker, “Dead woman’s ultrasound showed clot, problems after abortion, records show,” *Mlive.com* (Apr. 13, 2017);
- Diamond Renee Williams, an 18-year-old who died after an abortion in Charlotte, *see* Cheryl Sullenger, “18 Year-Old Dies After Botched Legal Abortion, Found Face Down Foaming at the Mouth,” *LifeNews* (July 12, 2018) (with link to autopsy report excerpt);
- Lakisha Wilson, a 22-year-old who died after an abortion in Cleveland, *see* Scott Taylor, “Woman dies after being rushed to hospital following an abortion,” *Cleveland 19 News* (Apr. 1, 2014), <https://tinyurl.com/LakishaDies>; Statement of Cuyahoga County Medical Examiner’s Office, <https://tinyurl.com/Lakisha-Med> (medical examiner statement); Operation Rescue, “Autopsy Report Reveals Abortion Patient’s Hemorrhage Not Detected in Time” (July 1, 2014), <https://tinyurl.com/Lakisha-AutopRev> (with link to autopsy report);
- Maria Santiago, a 38-year-old who died after an abortion in Baltimore, *see* Jessica Chasmar, “4 Maryland abortion clinics shut down, 3 doctors suspended,” *The Washington Times* (June 6, 2013); “Notice of Current Violations, Imposition of Administrative Penalty Under State Regulations,” Md. Dep’t of Health and Mental Hygiene (Mar. 26,

2013) (state report on “Patient G”), <https://tinyurl.com/BaltDHMHNotice>;

- Jennifer Morbelli, a 29-year-old woman who died after an abortion in Maryland, *see* Chelsea Kiene, “Jennifer McKenna-Morbelli Death: Pro-Life Group Demands Justice After Abortion-Related Passing,” *Huffington Post* (Feb. 12, 2013), https://www.huffpost.com/entry/jennifer-mckenna-morbelli_n_2671375; “Authorities: Woman died from abortion complications,” *USA Today* (Feb. 21, 2013);
- Tanya Reaves, a 24-year-old who died after an abortion in Chicago, *see* Steve Miller, “Documents Shed Light On Woman’s Death After Abortion,” *CBS Chicago* (July 24, 2012), <https://tinyurl.com/TReavesDocs>; Order for Approval of Wrongful Death Settlement, *Jones v. Planned Parenthood of Ill.*, No. 2013 L 000076 (Cook Cty. Cir. Ct. L. Div. Jan. 24, 2014), <https://tinyurl.com/TReavesSettlem> (\$2 million wrongful death settlement); and
- Alexandra Nuñez, a 37-year-old who died after an abortion in Queens, New York, *see* Michael J. Feeney, Barry Paddock & Jonathan Lemire, “Queens clinic A1 Medicine probed after Alexandra Nunez is fatally injured while undergoing abortion,” *NY Daily News* (Jan. 26, 2010).

See also “Women’s Stories from the 2000s,” *Cemetery of Choice*, <http://www.cemeteryofchoice.com/The%202000s.html> (listing deaths); “Women’s Stories from the

2010s,” Cemetery of Choice, <http://www.cemeteryofchoice.com/The%202010s.html> (same for latest decade).

II. THE CLAIM THAT ABORTION IS SAFER THAN CHILDBIRTH IS A MYTH.

The common refrain that abortion is safer than childbirth is unsupported and almost certainly false. Indeed, the premises underlying this myth are embarrassingly inadequate, as demonstrated below. Perhaps for this reason, abortion apologists appear to have been quietly distancing themselves from the claim that abortion is safer than childbirth.

A. Relevance to abortion jurisprudence

An understanding about the relative safety of abortion versus childbirth has been an important consideration in this Court’s abortion jurisprudence. Most notably, the trimester framework that was established in *Roe v. Wade*, 410 U.S. 113 (1973), and which governed abortion cases until *Planned Parenthood v. Casey*, 505 U.S. 833 (1992), hinged in part on the “factual assumption,” *City of Akron v. Akron Ctr. for Reprod. Health*, 462 U.S. 416, 430 n.12 (1983), that “until the end of the first trimester mortality in abortion may be less than mortality in normal childbirth.” *Roe*, 410 U.S. at 163. *See also id.* at 149 & n.44 (asserting that “[m]ortality rates for women undergoing early abortions, where the procedure is legal, appear to be as low or lower than the rates for normal childbirth”) (citing, *inter alia*, abortion mortality figures from U.S.

Department of Health, Education, and Welfare (HEW)). In *Whole Woman's Health v. Hellerstedt* (WWH), 136 S. Ct. 2292 (2016), this Court referred to material in the record asserting that “[n]ationwide, childbirth is 14 times more likely than abortion to result in death,” *id.* at 2315 (addressed *infra* §II(E)). And the district court in the present case also found that childbirth was more dangerous than abortion. Pet. App. 209a (finding No. 205) (also addressed *infra* §II(E)). As noted *infra* § II(C), (D), the statistical premises for this claim collapse under scrutiny.

B. Repetition of the myth

The persistence of this myth is understandable. Abortion providers and advocates have long repeated the mantra that abortion (at least early abortion) is safer than childbirth. *See, e.g.*, “Safety of Abortion,” National Abortion Federation (NAF) (2006), <https://tinyurl.com/NAFAbSafety> (“Complications from having a first trimester aspiration abortion are considerably less frequent and less serious than those associated with giving birth”).⁸ Planned Parenthood also has a post claiming that “abortion is . . . 11 times safer than giving birth,” *see* “Is abortion safe?” *Planned Parenthood*, <https://tinyurl.com/PPAbSafeTeens>. *See also* “Medical and Social Health Benefits Since Abortion

⁸ NAF has not revised this page since December 2006. Elsewhere on its website, NAF baldly asserts, “Abortion is very safe and is at least 10 times safer than childbirth,” <https://prochoice.org/faq-items/abortion-is-much-more-dangerous-than-childbirth/> (Mar. 29, 2014), but provides no supporting authorities or links.

Was Made Legal in the U.S.,” *Planned Parenthood*, <https://tinyurl.com/PPAbSafe> (“the risk of death associated with childbirth is about 14 times as high as that associated with abortion”). The National Academies of Sciences (NAS) most recently has taken up the same mantle, see NAS “The Safety and Quality of Abortion Care in the United States” at 74-75 (2018).⁹ The

⁹ NAS shows bias in the very title of its report, employing the phrase “abortion care”. Use of this term as a substitute for “abortion” is apparently a fairly new marketing strategy. Until Judge Pregerson used the term in a 2012 opinion for the Ninth Circuit, *McCormack v. Hiedeman*, 694 F.3d 1004, 1012, 1018 (9th Cir. 2012), the phrase does not (according to a LEXIS search) appear in any federal circuit court opinion, other than as a quotation of other sources or document titles. This Court has not used the phrase at all except once when quoting a witness for the abortion providers in *Whole Woman’s Health v. Hellerstedt*, 136 S. Ct. 2292, 2316 (2016). The phrase, however, appears to be becoming *de rigeur* in abortion advocacy circles, even if the transition is somewhat slow in coming. Compare International Planned Parenthood Federation (IPPF), “How to talk about abortion: a guide to rights-based messaging” (2015) <https://tinyurl.com/IPPF2015Guide> (not yet urging use of phrase “abortion care”) with IPPF, “How to talk about abortion: A rights-based messaging guide” (2018) <https://tinyurl.com/IPPF2018Guide> (replacing “abortion services” with “abortion care” on p. 10, bottom left tab, and questioning use of the word “abortion” (p. 15) for its possible “negative connotations”).

The point of the phrase “abortion care” is presumably to soften the impact of the stark word “abortion” by adding the appealing word “care.” Nevertheless, the phrase “abortion care” is awkward and, from the perspective of abortion proponents, redundant. A surgeon does a heart bypass, not “heart bypass care.” A technician does a mammogram, not “mammogram care”. And an abortionist does abortions, not “abortion care.” See also *ProMedica Health* (continued...)

challengers in *Whole Woman's Health* made the same assertion. Their complaint repeatedly asserted that abortion was safer than childbirth. No. 15-274, Cplt. ¶¶ 80, 105, 130 (No. 15-274, JA 148, 154, 160). The *WWH* complaint went so far as to assert that the risk of maternal death was 14 times higher in childbirth than abortion. *Id.* This allegation related to *WWH*'s claim that when abortion becomes unavailable, risk to maternal health increases.

C. Refutation of the myth and possible backpedaling

Amicus ACLJ filed a brief in *Whole Woman's Health* that thoroughly refuted the claim that abortion is safer than childbirth. *See* Amicus Brief of American Center for Law & Justice *et al.*, *Whole Woman's Health v. Hellerstedt*, No. 15-274 (Feb. 2, 2016) (ACLJ *WWH* brief), <https://tinyurl.com/WWH-ACLJ-Amicus>.

Perhaps for reasons similar to those set forth in that ACLJ amicus brief, major abortion advocacy groups may be quietly backing off the claim that abortion is safer than childbirth. For example, Planned Parenthood recently removed a similar claim from its website. *Compare* "In-Clinic Abortion Procedures," *Planned Parenthood*, <https://tinyurl.com/PP-Apr-2016> (Apr. 21, 2016 version; click on "How Safe Are In-Clinic Abortion Procedures?": "the risk of death from childbirth is 11

⁹ (...continued)

Sys. v. FTC, 749 F.3d 559, 567 (6th Cir. 2014) (invoking "Orwell's admonition to use concrete terms instead of vague ones, see Orwell, *Politics and the English Language* (1946)").

times greater than the risk of death from an abortion procedure during the first 20 weeks of pregnancy”) *with* “How safe is an in-clinic abortion?” *Planned Parenthood*, <https://tinyurl.com/PPcurrent> (no longer making that claim).¹⁰ NAF, meanwhile, has not updated its similar assertion in over a decade, *supra* note 8.

D. Dissecting the myth

The abandonment of the claim that abortion is safer than childbirth would be a strategically wise choice for abortion advocates, as the claim lacks defensible support – in short, it is a myth resting on inapposite and incomplete data.

The faulty claim rests essentially upon a comparison of pregnancy mortality (formerly called “maternal mortality”) and abortion mortality statistics published by the federal Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). *See, e.g.*, Elizabeth G. Raymond & David A. Grimes, *The comparative safety of legal induced abortion and childbirth in the United States*, 119 *Obstet. Gynec.* 215, 215-16 (2012), <https://tinyurl.com/Raymond-Grimes>.¹¹ *But see* Priscilla Coleman, “A Serious Misrepresentation of the Relative Safety of

¹⁰ Based on Internet Archive captures of the website pages, Planned Parenthood quietly dropped the assertion between December 2016 and January 2017, i.e., within a year of amicus ACLJ’s refutation of the claim in its *WWH* amicus brief. The similar Planned Parenthood assertions cited *supra* predate this deletion and may have escaped the web editors’ notice.

¹¹ The NAS report referenced *supra* p. 14 likewise relies upon the same data. *See* NAS Report at 75 (Table 2-4 & listed sources, including the Raymond and Grimes article).

Induced Abortion Compared to Childbirth Published in a Leading Medical Journal,” *We Care*, <https://tinyurl.com/Coleman-Critique-R-G> (identifying multiple flaws in the Raymond & Grimes study and citing contrary references); David Reardon, “Rebuttal of Raymond and Grimes” (Aug. 2012), <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6027034/>.

As demonstrated below, the claim that abortion is safer than childbirth *at all*, much less by an order of magnitude, is unsupported and almost certainly incorrect. *See, e.g.*, Byron Calhoun, *Systematic Review: The maternal mortality myth in the context of legalized abortion*, 80 *The Linacre Q.* 264 (2013), <https://tinyurl.com/BCalhounSysRev>. This Court therefore should not assume that access to abortion provides a life- or health-saving benefit to pregnant women.

While the *Roe* Court treated the relative safety of (early) abortion over childbirth as “now-established medical fact,” 410 U.S. at 163, this “fact” – properly recharacterized thereafter by the *Akron* Court as a “factual assumption,” 462 U.S. at 430 n.12 – is no such thing. First, the unthinking comparison of pregnancy mortality and abortion mortality statistics is *not* probative because there are crucial differences in the derivation of these statistics. It is a comparison of apples and oranges. Second, the medical literature strongly, arguably overwhelmingly, indicates that abortion is *poor* health care for women, particular as compared to the alternative of childbirth, *infra* § III.

Key points about the flawed basis for the abortion-is-safer claim include the following:

First, **abortion deaths are also counted as “pregnancy deaths,” thereby misleadingly inflating the measure of deaths supposedly from childbirth.**¹² This point bears emphasis: when a woman dies from abortion, that death counts *both* as an abortion mortality *and* as a pregnancy mortality. With such an approach, the results are mathematically stacked against childbirth ever being deemed safer than abortion: *even if every single woman in a single year who had an abortion died from the procedure, and only one woman that year died from a miscarriage or complication of childbirth, the total number of deaths in the “pregnancy mortality” category for that year would*

¹² “A pregnancy-related death is defined as the death of a woman while pregnant or within 1 year of the end of a pregnancy—*regardless of the outcome, duration or site of the pregnancy—from any cause related to or aggravated by the pregnancy or its management*, but not from accidental or incidental causes.” CDC, “Pregnancy Mortality Surveillance System,” <https://tinyurl.com/CDCPregMortality> (emphasis added). The CDC acknowledges that its tally of abortion deaths is taken from the CDC’s Pregnancy Mortality System, and thus represents a subset of deaths that are double-counted as both pregnancy deaths and abortion deaths. See Karen Pazol, *et al.*, Abortion Surveillance – United States, 2010, *CDC Morbidity & Mortality Wkly. Rep.: Surveillance Summaries* (Nov. 29, 2013), <https://tinyurl.com/CDC-Pazol>; *id.* at 4 (first para. under Methods subsection Abortion Mortality: describing criterion for listing a “pregnancy-related death” as also an “abortion-related death”; second para. under Methods subsection Abortion Mortality: “Since 1987, CDC has monitored abortion-related deaths through its Pregnancy Mortality Surveillance System”); *id.* at 8 (first para. under Results subsection Abortion Mortality: “Using national data from the Pregnancy Surveillance System” to identify abortion deaths).

still be higher than the total deaths in the “abortion mortality” category.

This makes comparison of the two figures positively absurd. The abortion mortality rate – “legal induced abortion-related deaths per 100,000 reported legal abortions,” CDC, “Abortion Surveillance – United States, 2016” <https://tinyurl.com/CDCAbortionSurveillance>, will *inevitably* be lower than the pregnancy mortality rate, regardless of actual relative lethality, except where the denominator for the abortion statistic – the number of procedures – is so low as to counterbalance the inherent slanting of the comparison. That is, only where the number of abortions is relatively small, as with later-term procedures, will the abortion mortality rate figure have a chance of exceeding the pregnancy mortality rate figure.

Second, **pregnancy mortality is measured per childbirth, not per pregnancy,¹³ and thus is further artificially inflated.** That is, the relevant maternal population arbitrarily excludes those who experience miscarriages and stillbirths, except that *if such women die, their deaths are nevertheless included in the maternal mortality totals.* Thus, the relevant baseline population is reduced by excluding cases of pregnancy losses (no live birth), yet the total number of deaths still includes those maternal deaths resulting from these very same excluded – uncounted – pregnancies.

¹³ “The pregnancy-related mortality ratio is an estimate of the number of pregnancy-related deaths for every 100,000 live births.” *Pregnancy Mortality Surveillance System*, CDC, <https://tinyurl.com/CDCPregMortality>.

For example, even though many women survive ectopic pregnancies, the supposed pregnancy mortality rate for the subset of all ectopic pregnancies will be infinitely high. There will be some maternal deaths in the numerator but *no live births* in the denominator, yielding an infinitely large fraction. Obviously, this is a completely misleading, useless, statistic. But this same error will in turn infect and distort the overall pregnancy mortality rate by adding to the numerator (deaths) while not adding to the baseline denominator (live births). This is no trivial distortion: historically, ectopic pregnancies have been the leading cause of deaths in the first trimester. See “Current Trends Ectopic Pregnancy – United States,” 1990-92, *CDC Morbidity & Mortality Wkly. Rep.: Surveillance Summaries*, Jan. 27, 1995, at 46, www.cdc.gov/mmwr/preview/mmwrhtml/00035709.htm.

The same distortion flows from the inclusion of deaths from early miscarriages, while excluding the number of associated pregnancies from the baseline. As with ectopic pregnancies – or any other pregnancy mishap that produces no live birth (including, ironically, abortions) – this combination of statistical parameters misleadingly inflates the reported percentage risk of childbirth (in mathematical terms, the numerator [maternal deaths] is maximized, while the denominator [not all pregnancies, only live births] of the risk fraction is arbitrarily reduced). Hence, the pregnancy mortality figure, contrary to its title, does *not* accurately depict

the mortality risk of pregnancy. Instead, the statistic *overstates* the risk.¹⁴

Third, **the overall pregnancy mortality figures do not account for the stage of gestation.** A high percentage of maternal deaths are associated with miscarriages early in pregnancy; but obviously, for example, a woman entering her second trimester faces zero risk of a first-trimester death from ectopic pregnancy, yet the undifferentiated pregnancy mortality rate incorporates those first-trimester deaths. For a woman who is beyond any given stage of pregnancy and considering the relative risks of continued pregnancy versus abortion, it makes no sense to compare abortion mortality with pregnancy mortality *throughout* pregnancy; the figures would have to be adjusted to subtract out deaths occurring at stages of pregnancy that have already passed.¹⁵ Yet pregnancy mortality statistics do not make this adjustment and thus are not properly comparable to abortion mortality statistics.

Fourth, **abortion deaths are underreported.** One simply cannot make a fair assessment of abortion deaths without knowing how many there were. Yet one published study found that, in Finland, *an astounding 94% of abortion-associated deaths were not identified*

¹⁴ The CDC may well have practical reasons for selecting the parameters it does. *See* Appx. at 71a-72a. But the impact these parameters have on the results – and on any attempted comparison with abortion mortality data – must be taken in to account.

¹⁵ For example, ectopic pregnancy usually manifests itself “between 6 and 10 weeks’ gestation,” Vanitha N. Sivalingam *et al.*, “Diagnosis and management of ectopic pregnancy,” 37 *J. Fam. Plann. Reprod. Health Care* 231, 232 (2011).

from death certificates or cause-of-death registries alone. Mika Gissler, *et al.*, “Methods for identifying pregnancy-related deaths: population-based data from Finland 1987-2000,” 18 *Paediatric & Perinatal Epidemiology* 448, 451 & tbl. 2 (2004). Aggravating the problem of unidentified abortion deaths in this country is the fact that “the collection and reporting of abortion data are not federally mandated,” CDC, “Abortion Surveillance – United States, 2016,” *supra* p. 19 (“Description of the Surveillance System”). *See also* David C. Reardon, *et al.*, “Deaths Associated with Abortion Compared with Childbirth – A Review of New and Old Data and the Medical and Legal Implications,” 20 *J. Contemp. Health Law & Pol’y* 279, 286-91 (2004) (hereinafter Reardon, “Deaths Associated with Abortion”); *id.* at 289-90 (noting that official coding standards impede the reporting of abortion deaths); David C. Reardon, “The Cover-Up: Why U.S. Abortion Mortality Statistics Are Meaningless,” 8 *The Post-Abortion Review* (Apr.-June 2000) (recounting numerous instances where independent investigators found, or other sources revealed, far more abortion deaths than the CDC reported); “The CDC’s Abortion Death Numbers, and What They Mean,” *RealChoice* (Aug. 8, 2012), <https://tinyurl.com/RealChoiceCDCAbDthCount> (illustrating incompleteness of CDC abortion mortality numbers across multiple years); “The CDC Report and Abortion Deaths,” *ClinicQuotes* (Aug. 29, 2012), <https://clinicquotes.com/the-cdc-report-and-abortion-deaths/> (documenting specific instance of well-publicized abortion death that CDC failed to report).

Fifth, **abortion mortality statistics likely will not include many delayed deaths that result from abortion**,¹⁶ deaths such as those reflected in the increased rates of suicide or other longer-term fatal post-abortion health consequences, even though studies show a greater risk of death from these and other causes after abortion (as opposed to childbirth). *Infra* § III. A fair comparison of abortion with continued child-bearing, like a fair comparison of smoking with nonsmoking, would have to take into account not just immediate consequences, but also all other statistically significant increased death risks.

E. Response to contrary statements in *Whole Woman's Health* & District Court findings

In light of the foregoing, the contrary statements in this Court's majority in *Whole Woman's Health v. Hellerstedt* (*WWH*), and the findings of the district court in the present case, are easily addressed.

In *WWH*, this Court referred to material in the record asserting that “[n]ationwide, childbirth is 14 times more likely than abortion to result in death,” 136 S. Ct. at 2315 (citing that case's Joint Appendix at 272).

¹⁶ The CDC defines an abortion-related death as including “a death resulting from a direct complication of an abortion (legal or illegal), an indirect complication caused by a chain of events initiated by an abortion, or an aggravation of a preexisting condition by the physiologic or psychologic effects of abortion,” CDC, “Abortion Surveillance 2016,” *supra* p. 19, plus any “pregnancy-related death in which the pregnancy outcome was induced abortion,” Pazol, *supra* note 12, at 4.

But the cited record reference was to the testimony of Elizabeth Raymond, who in turn simply cited her own Raymond & Grimes study discussed and refuted *supra* § II(D).

The district court in the present case, meanwhile, made the following finding:

There is far more risk associated with carrying a pregnancy to term and delivering a baby than with abortion. (Doc. 190 at 129:22-130:5, 199:6-10; JX 123 ¶ 61; Doc. 195 at 32:4-10.)

Pet. App. 209a (finding No. 205). But the record references do not provide any solid support of the proposition that abortion is safer than childbirth. JX 123 is the petitioners' expert report of Dr. Christopher Estes. Dr. Estes states at ¶ 61 (Rec. p. 2459) that some women who do not have access to abortion "instead, carry unwanted pregnancies to term," and that these women "are exposed to increased risks of major complications from childbirth, including death," but he provides no supporting citation. Dr. Estes does indicate (¶ 67, Rec. pp. 2460-61) that he relied in part on CDC abortion surveillance reports. As discussed *supra* § II(D), such reports provide no valid basis for concluding that childbirth is safer than abortion. Beyond that, the citation to Doc. 190 at 129-30 (JA 218-19) is to trial testimony of petitioners' witness Dr. Doe No. 3, who ventures a somewhat hedged opinion in response to a question about his "own experience" and offers no

supporting reference.¹⁷ Doc. 190 at 199 (JA 288) is trial testimony of Dr. Estes, who simply repeats, without reference, the assertion that abortion is safer than childbirth. Doc. 195 at 32 (JA 1051) is the testimony of petitioners' witness Prof. Eva Pressman, who simply repeats the assertion without any supporting reference. In short, aside from adding "me too" affirmations, the record references identify no substantive support for the proposition that abortion is safer than childbirth.

* * *

As demonstrated, the seemingly straightforward comparison of the CDC's pregnancy mortality and abortion mortality rates is in fact fundamentally misguided and rife with flaws. As the CDC itself has admitted, the statistics for pregnancy mortality and abortion mortality are "conceptually different" and "used by CDC for different public health purposes," Letter of Louise Gerberding, Director, Centers for

¹⁷ The passage is as follows:

Q NOW DR. DOE 3, *IN YOUR EXPERIENCE*, HOW DO THE RISKS AND COMPLICATIONS OF ABORTION COMPARE TO THE RISKS AND COMPLICATION OF CARRYING A PREGNANCY TO TERM AND CHILDBIRTH?
 A OH, *THAT'S A REALLY COMPLICATED QUESTION. I DON'T KNOW HOW EXACTLY TO ANSWER THAT*. YOU KNOW, THERE ARE FAR MORE RISKS ASSOCIATED WITH CARRYING A PREGNANCY TO TERM AND DELIVERING A BABY THAN THERE SEEM TO BE WITH ABORTION. WE HAVE FAR FEWER PROBLEMS WITH ABORTION THAN WE DO WITH CARRYING A PREGNANCY TO TERM.

Doc. 190 at 129:22-130:5 (JA 218-19) (emphases added).

Disease Control (July 20, 2004), *see* Appendix B (reproducing correspondence). *See also* John M. Thorp, Jr., “Public Health Impact of Legal Termination of Pregnancy in the US: 40 Years Later,” 2012 *Scientifica* 1, 4 (“Differences in ascertainment of deaths, duration of susceptibility to mortality, lack of accounting for gestational age, and choice of appropriate comparison group make these comparisons a fool’s errand”). For purposes of comparison they are apples and oranges.

There is strong evidence that abortion is positively detrimental to maternal health and, if anything, more likely to lead to death or other adverse consequences than is continuing the pregnancy. *See infra* § III. Access to abortion is no favor to women’s health.

III. PUBLISHED LITERATURE INDICATES THAT, IF ANYTHING, ABORTION IS *MORE* DANGEROUS THAN CONTINUED PREGNANCY.

Peer reviewed medical research strongly indicates that abortion, rather than being safer than childbirth, is in fact more dangerous.

In Finland, for example, researchers drew upon national health care data to examine the pregnancy history of *all* women of childbearing age who died, for any reason, within one year of childbirth, abortion, or miscarriage, between 1987 and 1994 (a total of nearly 10,000 women). The study found that, adjusting for age, *women who had abortions were 3.5 times more likely to die within a year* than women who carried to term. Mika Gissler, *et al.*, “Pregnancy-associated deaths in Finland

1987-1994 – definition problems and benefits of record linkage,” 76 *Acta Obstetrica et Gynecologica Scandinavica* 651 (1997). *See also* E. Karalis, *et al.*, “Decreasing mortality during pregnancy and for a year after while mortality after termination of pregnancy remains high: a population-based register study of pregnancy-associated deaths in Finland 2001-2012,” 124 *BJOG* 1115 (2017); *id.* at 1117 (“In all age groups under 40, mortality rates were highest after termination of pregnancy”); *id.* at 1119 (“Combining all causes of deaths, the mortality rate after termination of pregnancy is . . . alarming”).

A study based upon Medicaid records in California likewise found significantly higher mortality rates after abortion. The study linked abortion and childbirth records in 1989 with death certificates for the years 1989-97. This study found that, adjusting for age, *women who had an abortion were 62% more likely to die from any cause than women who gave birth.* David C. Reardon, *et al.*, “Deaths associated with pregnancy outcome: A record linkage study of low income women,” 95 *So. Med. J.* 834 (2002).

Yet another study, this one of nearly a half million Danish women, found that the risk of death after abortion was significantly higher than the risk of death after childbirth. David C. Reardon & Priscilla K. Coleman, “Short and long term mortality rates associated with first pregnancy outcome: Population register based study for Denmark 1980-2004,” 18 *Med. Sci. Mon.* 71 (2012). The study specifically examined both early (before 12 weeks gestation) and late (after 12 weeks gestation) abortions, and found statistically

significantly higher death rates for *both* groups as compared to mortality after childbirth. Another study of the entire population of Denmark found a *dose effect* – that is, each additional abortion increased the risk of premature death of the woman: “Increased risks of death were 45%, 114% and 191% for 1, 2 and 3 abortions, respectively, compared with no abortions after controlling for other reproductive outcomes and last pregnancy age” Priscilla K. Coleman *et al.*, “Reproductive history patterns and long-term mortality rates: a Danish, population-based record linkage study,” 23 *Eur. J. Pub. Health* 569, 569 (2012).

In fact, a systematic literature review has shown that *every record linkage study* examining mortality rates after abortion and childbirth *has found an elevated risk of death associated with abortion*. David C. Reardon & John M. Thorp, “Pregnancy associated death in record linkage studies relative to delivery, termination of pregnancy, and natural losses: A systematic review with a narrative synthesis and meta-analysis,” *SAGE Open Med.* (Nov 13, 2017), <https://tinyurl.com/RecordLinkageReview>. At least part of this increased risk of death is due to psychological effects, such as suicide. The Finland and California studies both showed, *inter alia*, a heightened risk of suicide after abortion.¹⁸ (The Danish study did not examine this aspect.) A British study found the same thing. Christopher L. Morgan, *et al.*, “Mental health

¹⁸ See also Mika Gissler, *et al.*, “Suicides after pregnancy in Finland: 1987-94: register linkage study,” 313 *British Med. J.* 1431 (1996) (suicide rate after induced abortion was six times higher than suicide rate after childbirth).

may deteriorate as a direct effect of induced abortion,” 314 *British Med. J.* 902 (Mar. 22, 1997) (letters section) (suicide attempts more than four times as frequent after abortion than after childbirth). All these studies are consistent with the many studies documenting adverse emotional consequences after abortion. See David C. Reardon, “Abortion Decisions and the Duty to Screen: Clinical, Ethical and Legal Implications of Predictive Risk Factors of Post-Abortion Maladjustment,” 20 *J. Contemp. Health L. & Pol’y* 33, 39 n.14 (2003) (citing nearly three dozen sources).

A related consequence of abortion is the elevated risk of substance abuse. See, e.g., David C. Reardon & Phillip G. Ney, “Abortion and Subsequent Substance Abuse,” 26 *Am. J. Drug & Alcohol Abuse* 61 (2000); David C. Reardon, *et al.*, “Substance use associated with unintended pregnancy outcomes in the National Longitudinal Survey of Youth,” 26 *Am. J. Drug & Alcohol Abuse* 369 (2004); Priscilla K. Coleman, *et al.*, “Substance use among pregnant women in the context of previous reproductive loss and desire for current pregnancy,” 10 *British J. Health Psychol.* 255 (2005).

Other psychological effects associated with abortion may also contribute to a decline in health. Notably, there is a clear scientific consensus that *abortion contributes to mental health problems* in some women. The only controversy is when, if ever, abortion is the *sole* cause of specific mental illnesses in specific groups of women at higher risk. David C. Reardon, “The abortion and mental health controversy: A comprehensive literature review of common ground agreements, disagreements, actionable recommenda-

tions, and research opportunities,” *SAGE Open Med.* (Oct 29 2018), <https://tinyurl.com/RevAbMentalHlth>.

Of course, abortion can also cause physical harm, either from the procedure itself (e.g., perforation of the uterus, laceration of the cervix), from deprivation of the health benefits of continuing pregnancy (e.g., eliminating the protective effect of a full-term pregnancy against breast cancer),¹⁹ or by masking other dangerous symptoms (e.g., a woman with an infection or an ectopic pregnancy may believe her symptoms are merely normal after-effects of abortion, leading her to delay seeking medical help).²⁰ *See generally* “Physical effects of abortion: Fact sheets, news, articles, links to published studies and more,” *The UnChoice*, www.theunchoice.com/physical.htm (listing sequelae and referencing sources); Reardon, “Deaths Associated with Abortion,” *supra* p. 22, at 311-17 (same).

* * *

Just as “time has overtaken some of *Roe*’s factual assumptions,” *Planned Parenthood v. Casey*, 505 U.S. at 860, so *evidence* has overtaken the assumptions and assertions of *Roe*, and of abortion apologists, about the safety of abortion. There is now ample reason to believe that abortion is *detrimental* to maternal health and, if

¹⁹ *See* Justin D. Heminger, “Big Abortion: What the Antiabortion Movement Can Learn from Big Tobacco,” 54 *Cath. U.L. Rev.* 1273, 1288-90 & nn.119 & 121 (2005) (citing sources).

²⁰ *Cf.* Reardon, “Deaths Associated with Abortion,” *supra* p. 22, at 289 & nn.26-27 (CDC does not count as abortion death a death from ectopic pregnancy that ruptures after the woman had an abortion, even though “the deaths are at least partially due to the failure of the abortion provider to verify the site of the pregnancy and the completion of the abortion”).

anything, *more likely* to lead to death or other adverse consequences for the pregnant woman than is continuing the pregnancy.

Abortion is a procedure fraught with hazards. The notion that abortion is safer than childbirth rests on inapposite comparisons and incomplete data, flies in the face of far more rigorous peer-reviewed studies, and should not be relied upon by this Court for any purposes.

CONCLUSION

This Court should affirm the judgment of the Fifth Circuit.

Respectfully submitted,

Thomas P. Monaghan	Jay Alan Sekulow
Francis J. Manion	<i>Counsel of Record</i>
CeCe Heil	Stuart J. Roth
Geoffrey R. Surtees	Colby M. May
American Center for	Walter M. Weber
Law & Justice	American Center for
1000 Regent University	Law & Justice
Drive	201 Maryland Avenue, NE
Virginia Beach, VA 23464	Washington, DC 20002
(757) 226-2489	(202) 546-8890
	sekulow@aclj.org

Counsel for Amici Curiae

January 2, 2020

APPENDICES

**APPENDIX A: Documented ambulance calls
2009-19**

2009

Feb. 6, 2009, Charlotte, NC

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/

Feb. 26, 2009, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Mar. 12, 2009, Dayton, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/pattern-of-abortion-complications-at-haskell-clinics-prompts-complaint/
(911 recording included)

Mar. 12, 2009, Wichita, KS

www.operationrescue.org/archives/tiller-abortion-patient-transported-to-hospital-%E2%80%9Cno-lights-no-sirens%E2%80%9D/

June 13, 2009, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

June 17, 2009, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

June 30, 2009, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

Aug. 11, 2009, New Rochelle, NY

www.newrochelletalk.com/node/1118

Aug. 20, 2009, New Rochelle, NY
www.newrochelletalk.com/node/1118
Aug. 27, 2009, New Rochelle, NY
www.newrochelletalk.com/node/1118
Sept. 16, 2009, Orange, CA
www.lifenews.com/2009/09/30/state-4466/
Sept. 26, 2009, Orange, CA
www.lifenews.com/2009/09/30/state-4466/
Sept. 29, 2009, St. Louis, MO
www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/ (two incidents)
Oct. 3, 2009, Riverside, CA
www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-rushes-third-planned-parenthood-abortion-patient-to-the-hospital/
Oct. 13, 2009, Sacramento, CA
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dj4ZyV1Bur8> (video)
Oct. 22, 2009, St. Louis, MO
www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/
Oct. 24, 2009, St. Louis, MO
www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/
Nov. 6, 2009, Little Rock, AR
https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Dec. 6, 2009, Charlotte, NC
www.operationrescue.org/archives/alive-or-dead-video-shows-ambulance-at-north-carolina-abortion-clinic/
(incl. video)

2010

Jan. 22, 2010, St. Louis, MO
www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

Feb. 19, 2010, Little Rock, AR
https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Mar. 18, 2010, St. Louis, MO
www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

Mar. 27, 2010, Little Rock, AR
https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Mar. 30, 2010, Riverside, CA
www.lifenews.com/2010/04/02/state-4953/

Mar. 31, 2010, St. Louis, MO
www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

Apr. 2, 2010, St. Louis, MO
www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

May 24, 2010, Naples, FL

www.lifenews.com/2010/05/24/state-5118/; www.foxnews.com/story/2010/05/27/planned-parenthood-patient-taken-to-hospital-after-procedure.html

June 12, 2010, Cleveland, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/; <http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/Preterm-Complication-6-12-10.pdf> (state health department records)

Aug. 23, 2010, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

Sept. 18, 2010, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toApril2018CADList-v2#from_embed

2011

Jan. 7, 2011, Boston, MA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-transport-victim-from-boston-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic/

Jan. 11, 2011, Boston, MA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/powerful-new-video-exposes-harm-caused-by-obama-funded-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinics/ (portion of video)

Feb. 4, 2011, Akron, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/;
<http://operationrescue.org/pdfs/Akron%20Women's%20Abortion%20Complications%201.pdf> (state health department records)

Feb. 5, 2011, Ft. Pierce, FL

<http://sohltc.com/2011/02/07/breaking-news-ambulance-takes-woman-from-ft-pierce-abortion-clinic-with-her/>

Feb. 12, 2011, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/emergency-transport-from-planned-parenthood-makes-another-case-for-defunding/

Feb. 16, 2011, Cincinnati, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/;
<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/PP-Cincy-Abortion-Complications-2-2012.pdf> (state health department records)

Mar. 12, 2011, Charlotte, NC

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/

Mar. 18, 2011, Charlotte, NC

<https://www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/>

Mar. 18, 2011, Everett, WA

www.lifenews.com/2011/03/21/planned-parenthood-sends-woman-to-hospital-after-botched-abortion/;
<http://abortionstate.blogspot.com/2011/04/911-audio-confirms-planned-parenthood.html>

Apr. 1, 2011, Aurora, IL

www.operationrescue.org/archives/powerful-new-video-exposes-harm-caused-by-obama-funded-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinics/ (portion of video)

Apr. 8, 2011, Milwaukee, WI

www.operationrescue.org/archives/as-naf-celebrates-video-documents-two-abortion-injuries-inflicted-by-naf-member/ (incl. video; two ambulances)

Apr. 9, 2011, West Palm Beach, FL

www.lifenews.com/2011/04/15/woman-rushed-to-hospital-in-florida-after-botched-abortion/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/another-naf-abortion-clinic-transport-injured-woman-via-ambulance/; www.christiannewswire.com/news/3303316750.html

Apr. 14, 2011, St. Paul, MN

www.operationrescue.org/archives/minnesota-activists-reports-4th-abortion-emergency-transport-in-a-week/ (incl. video)

Apr. 22, 2011, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

May 12, 2011, Albuquerque, NM

www.lifenews.com/2011/04/17/this-late-term-abortion-clinic-shoots-babies-through-the-heart-with-poison-to-kill-them/ (incl. 911 call)

May 25, 2011, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

June 8, 2011, Columbus, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/;
<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/East-PP-2-Ab-Comp-2011.pdf> (state health department records)

June 12, 2011, Bronx, NY

www.operationrescue.org/archives/botched-abortion-emergency-takes-place-at-clinic-caught-in-dumping-scandal/

July 6, 2011, Cleveland, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/;
<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/Preterm-Complication7-6-11.pdf> (state health department records)

Sept. 2, 2011, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toApril2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Sept. 22, 2011, Columbus, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/;
<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/East-PP-2-Ab-Comp-2011.pdf> (state health department records)

Oct. 6, 2011, Dayton, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/
(with link to state report)

Oct. 14, 2011, Virginia Beach, VA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-911-tape-reveals-botched-abortion-at-virginia-planned-parenthood/
(incl. video with 911 call)

Oct. 19, 2011, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

Oct. 21, 2011, Milwaukee, WI

www.lifenews.com/2011/10/27/clinic-workers-laugh-as-woman-injured-in-botched-abortion/ (video included)

Dec. 20, 2011, Sioux City, IA

www.lifenews.com/2011/12/21/planned-parenthood-botches-abortion-sends-woman-to-hospital/

Dec. 22, 2011, Stockton, CA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-rushes-woman-to-hospital-after-pre-christmas-abortion-injury/

2012

Jan. 21, 2012, Birmingham, AL

www.lifenews.com/2012/01/22/botched-abortions-injure-two-women-in-birmingham-alabama/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/abortion-clinic-hid-critical-information-about-botched-abortions-new-evidence-shows-911-recordings-included/; http://news.christiansunite.com/Religion_News/religion10151.shtml (two women taken in ambulances)

Jan. 21, 2012, Little Rock, AR
https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officeP ark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Feb. 2, 2012, Little Rock, AR
https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officeP ark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Feb. 6, 2012, Charlotte, NC
www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-kill ed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-le ast-20-more-women/

Feb. 9, 2012, Dayton, OH
[www.operationrescue.org/archives/pattern-of-abortion -complications-at-haskell-clinics-prompts-complaint/ \(incl. 911 call\)](http://www.operationrescue.org/archives/pattern-of-abortion -complications-at-haskell-clinics-prompts-complaint/ (incl. 911 call))

Mar. 3, 2012, Fairfax, VA
[www.operationrescue.org/archives/troubled-virginia-a bortion-clinic-puts-bleeding-botched-abortion-patient-i n-hospital/ \(incl. video with 911 call\)](http://www.operationrescue.org/archives/troubled-virginia-a bortion-clinic-puts-bleeding-botched-abortion-patient-i n-hospital/ (incl. video with 911 call))

Mar. 3, 2012, Little Rock, AR
https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officeP ark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Mar. 6, 2012, St. Paul, MN
[www.lifenews.com/2012/03/13/planned-parenthood-bo tches-abortion-sends-woman-to-hospital-2/ \(incl. video\)](http://www.lifenews.com/2012/03/13/planned-parenthood-bo tches-abortion-sends-woman-to-hospital-2/ (incl. video))

Mar. 15, 2012, Little Rock, AR
https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officeP ark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Mar. 17, 2012, Austin, TX
www.operationrescue.org/archives/medical-emergenci es-at-one-texas-abortion-clinic-support-the-need-for-h ospital-privileges/

Mar. 28, 2012, Sharonville, OH

www.lifenews.com/2012/03/28/woman-rushed-to-cincinnati-hospital-possible-botched-abortion/; www.lifenews.com/2012/08/21/woman-rushed-to-ohio-hospital-after-botched-late-term-abortion/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/pattern-of-abortion-complications-at-haskell-clinics-prompts-complaint/ (incl. 911 call)

Mar. 31, 2012, Hempstead, NY

www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=12&v=mUHxEfBjbTQ

Mar. 31, 2012, Cleveland, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/fire-marshall-ignores-danger-of-broken-elevator-at-abortion-clinic-where-patient-died/ (incl. video with 911 call)

Mar. 31, 2012, Bellevue, NE

www.lifenews.com/2012/05/23/moans-screams-heard-from-botched-abortion-victim-in-911-call/ (incl. 911 call)

Apr. 2, 2012, Austin, TX

www.operationrescue.org/archives/medical-emergencies-at-one-texas-abortion-clinic-support-the-need-for-hospital-privileges/

Apr. 18, 2012, Austin, TX

www.operationrescue.org/archives/medical-emergencies-at-one-texas-abortion-clinic-support-the-need-for-hospital-privileges/

June 1, 2012, Haverhill, MA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/botched-abortion-victim-rushed-to-hospital-in-massachusetts/

June 26, 2012, St. Louis, MO

<https://www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-transport-27th-women-from-st-louis-planned-parenthood-abortion-center/>

July 6, 2012, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officeP ark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

July 7, 2012, Boston, MA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/powerful-new-video-exposes-harm-caused-by-obama-funded-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinics/ (portion of video)

July 7, 2012, Atlanta, GA

www.lifenews.com/2012/07/10/women-injured-by-botched-abortions-in-georgia-massachusetts/

July 19, 2012, Bedford Heights, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/;
<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/PP-Bedford-Abortion-Complications-01112013.pdf>
(state health department records)

July 20, 2012, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2012/07/26/planned-parenthood-waited-five-hours-before-sending-abortion-victim-to-er/

July 21, 2012, Milwaukee, WI

www.lifenews.com/2012/07/25/ambulances-called-after-wisconsin-abortion-biz-injures-women/ (two ambulances on same day)

Aug. 16, 2012, Dayton, OH

www.lifenews.com/2012/08/23/botched-abortion-911-calls-she-bleeding-quite-badly/ (incl. 911 recording);
<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/Dayton-Ab-Complication-15-wks.pdf> (medical record)

Aug. 16, 2012, Boise, ID

www.operationrescue.org/archives/powerful-new-video-exposes-harm-caused-by-obama-funded-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinics/ (portion of video)

Aug. 23, 2012, Houston, TX

www.operationrescue.org/archives/911-botched-abortion-hemorrhage-sends-planned-parenthood-client-to-hospital/ (incl. 911 call)

Aug. 31, 2012, Cleveland, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/; <http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/Preterm-Complications-2-08312012-03062013.pdf> (state health department records)

Sept. 29, 2012, Cleveland, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/rude-abortionist-calls-911-for-second-trimester-abortion-emergency/ (incl. 911 call)

Oct. 1, 2012, Charlotte, NC

www.christiannewswire.com/news/5431620831.html; www.lifenews.com/2012/10/04/doc-who-mentioned-killing-ugly-black-babies-botches-abortion/

Oct. 2, 2012, Kenmore, WA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/powerful-new-video-exposes-harm-caused-by-obama-funded-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinics/ (portion of video)

Oct. 13, 2012, Aurora, IL

<http://prolifeaction.org/hotline/2012/ambulanceppauro>; www.lifenews.com/2012/10/17/botched-abortion-another-ambulance-at-another-planned-parenthood/

Oct. 15, 2012, Bakersfield, CA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/bakersfield-abortion-clinic-sends-abortion-patient-to-the-hospital/

Oct. 26, 2012, Denver, CO

www.lifenews.com/2012/11/05/planned-parenthood-botches-another-abortion-16-in-22-months/; <http://operationrescue.org/pdfs/pprm-20121026-cad-detail.pdf> (911 incident report)

Oct. 31, 2012, Charlotte, NC

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/

Nov. 1, 2012, Cleveland, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/bloody-botched-22-week-abortion-second-for-cleveland-abortionist-in-5-weeks/ (incl. 911 call)

Nov. 2, 2012, Indianapolis, IN

www.operationrescue.org/archives/911-planned-parenthood-abortionist-halts-2nd-trimester-abortion-sends-patient-to-hospital/ (incl. 911 call)

Nov. 8, 2012, Chicago, IL

<http://prolifeaction.org/hotline/2012/albanyambulance/>

Nov. 10, 2012, Charlotte, NC

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/

Nov. 21, 2012, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/planned-parenthood-landed-abortion-patient-in-hospital-the-day-before-thanksgiving/

Dec. 1, 2012, Cleveland, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/abortion-patient-passes-out-turns-pale-as-ambulance-scrambles-to-help/
(incl. 911 call)

Dec. 1, 2012, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2012/12/28/st-louis-planned-parent-hood-botches-third-abortion-in-weeks/

Dec. 26, 2012, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/st-louis-planned-parent-hoods-sheets-of-shame-attempt-to-hide-4th-abortion-emergency/; <http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/01/12-079023-4251-Forest-Park-Med-Dispatch.pdf> (incident report)

2013

Jan. 19, 2013, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2013/01/21/planned-parent-hood-botches-abortion-tries-to-hide-victim/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/st-louis-planned-parent-hoods-sheets-of-shame-attempt-to-hide-4th-abortion-emergency/

Jan. 19, 2013, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Feb. 4, 2013, Bakersfield, CA

www.lifenews.com/2013/02/05/woman-rushed-to-hospital-after-botched-abortion-in-california/

Feb. 7, 2013, Albuquerque, NM

www.operationrescue.org/archives/breaking-ambulance-transported-another-sella-patient-to-hospital-moments-before-board-dismissed-negligence-charges/

Feb. 8, 2013, Wilmington, DE

www.lifenews.com/2013/03/04/planned-parenthood-injured-two-women-in-botched-abortions-in-delaware/ (911 recording)

Feb. 13, 2013, Baltimore, MD

www.operationrescue.org/archives/maryland-abortionist-that-killed-patient-identified/ (incl. link to 911 & police reports)

Feb. 13, 2013, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Feb. 16, 2013, Wilmington, DE

www.lifenews.com/2013/02/18/planned-parenthood-botches-abortion-hospitalizes-woman-in-delaware/ (video included); www.lifenews.com/2013/03/04/planned-parenthood-injured-two-women-in-botched-abortion-in-delaware/ (incl. video with 911 call)

Feb. 16, 2013, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Feb. 22, 2013, Orange, CA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/911-recordings-reveal-3-planned-parenthood-patients-suffering-serious-abortion-complications/ (incl. 911 call)

Mar. 1, 2013, Albuquerque, NM

www.operationrescue.org/archives/breaking-botched-abortion-at-albuquerque-late-term-abortion-clinic-lands-14th-woman-in-hospital/ (incl. video)

Mar. 5, 2013, Denver, CO

www.lifenews.com/2013/03/07/planned-parenthood-tries-to-hide-botched-abortion-injuring-woman-2/

Mar. 6, 2013, Cleveland, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/;
<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/Preterm-Complications-2-08312012-03062013.pdf>
(state health department records)

Mar. 9, 2013, Orange, CA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/911-recordings-reveal-3-planned-parenthood-patients-suffering-serious-abortion-complications/ (incl. 911 call)

Mar. 13, 2013, Wilmington, DE

www.operationrescue.org/archives/praying-catholic-grandma-violently-attacked-at-planned-parenthood-while-filming-botched-abortion-incident/

Mar. 23, 2013, Detroit, MI

www.lifenews.com/2013/04/01/ambulance-called-for-woman-after-botched-2nd-trimester-abortion/ (incl. video)

May 4, 2013, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2013/05/07/planned-parenthood-clinic-botches-abortion-in-new-york-city/

May 4, 2013, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

June 5, 2013, Madison, WI

<https://saynsumthn.wordpress.com/2013/06/11/ambulance-at-planned-parenthood/>

June 22, 2013, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

June 27, 2013, Falls Church, VA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-transport-patient-from-virginia-abortion-clinic-with-history-of-filth-unsafe-conditions/ (incl. video & link to 911 report)

July 9, 2013, Germantown, MD

www.operationrescue.org/archives/911-recording-bleeding-threat-minimized-by-carhart-abortion-clinic-worker/ (video 911 recording included)

Aug. 7, 2013, Jackson, MS

http://blog.al.com/spotnews/2013/08/patient_taken_by_ambulance_fro.html (incl. link to video);
www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-transport-woman-from-troubled-jackson-mississippi-abortion-clinic/ (incl. video)

Aug. 14, 2013, Houston, TX

www.lifenews.com/2013/08/15/planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-in-houston-rushes-woman-to-hospital/

Aug. 21, 2013, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/breaking-planned-parenthood-patient-rushed-to-hospital-hours-ago-in-st-louis/

Sept. 10, 2013, Falls Church, VA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/virginia-abortion-clinic-botches-two-abortions-after-suing-to-block-safety-rules/ (incl. 911 call)

Sept. 10, 2013, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/new-documents-reveal-dirty-conditions-political-cover-up-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

Sept. 14, 2013, Cleveland, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/high-risk-abortion-patient-lips-blue-barely-breathing-after-abortion-in-cleveland/ (incl. 911 call)

Sept. 27, 2013, Cleveland, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/; <http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/Preterm-Complication-09272013.pdf> (state health department records)

Oct. 2, 2013, Detroit, MI

www.operationrescue.org/archives/abortionist-who-killed-patient-sends-another-to-the-hospital-in-detroit/

Oct. 3, 2013, Bedford Heights, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/

Oct. 11, 2013, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/two-for-the-money-abortionists-injure-women-in-two-states/

Oct. 11, 2013, Montclair, CA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/two-for-the-money-abortionists-injure-women-in-two-states/ (incl. video)

Oct. 21, 2013, Victorville, CA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/after-just-42-days-in-business-victorville-planned-parenthood-hospitalizes-first-patient/

Oct. 29, 2013, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/botched-abortion-outbreak-reveals-urgent-safety-crisis-at-st-louis-planned-parenthood/

Nov. 23, 2013, Charlotte, NC

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/

Nov. 26, 2013, Germantown, MD

www.operationrescue.org/archives/911-redactions-fail-to-hide-hemorrhage-as-complication-to-carhart-late-term-abortion/ (incl. video with 911 call)

Nov. 30, 2013, Bellevue, NE

www.lifenews.com/2013/12/12/abortion-doc-injures-two-women-in-botched-abortions-in-four-days/ (incl. video)

Dec. 6, 2013, Cleveland, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/special-report-secret-ohio-department-of-health-docs-reveal-47-horrific-botched-abortions-countless-safety-violations-and-more/; <http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/Preterm-Complication-12-6-2013.pdf> (state health department records)

Dec. 14, 2013 Houston, TX

www.operationrescue.org/archives/protest-thursday-for-911-recordings-describe-abortion-related-complications-at-texas-planned-parenthood/ (911 recording included)

Dec. 23, 2013, Downey, CA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/911-california-abortion-patient-hemorrhaged-half-her-blood-after-medication-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

2014

Jan. 6, 2014, Bakersfield, CA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/first-botched-abortion-victim-of-2014-rushed-to-hospital-in-bakersfield/

Jan. 18, 2014, Aurora, IL

<http://lifedynamics.com/ambulance-called-planned-parenthood-botched-abortion/> (incl. video with 911 call);
www.lifenews.com/2014/01/21/ambulance-races-to-planned-parenthood-as-woman-injured-in-botched-abortion/ (incl. link to video)

Jan. 22, 2014, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Feb. 7, 2014, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Feb. 13, 2014, Albuquerque, NM

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulances-transport-two-patients-from-nations-largest-late-term-abortion-clinic-in-albuquerque/

Feb. 28, 2014, Southfield, MI

www.lifenews.com/2016/03/04/listen-to-a-desperate-abortionist-call-911-after-tearing-hole-in-womans-uterus-in-botched-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

Mar. 4, 2014, Germantown, MD

www.operationrescue.org/archives/another-carhart-botched-abortion-sends-patient-to-emergency-room/

Mar. 4, 2014, Madison, WI

www.lifenews.com/2014/03/10/planned-parenthood-injuries-two-women-in-abortions-armored-car-picks-up-cash-afterwards/

Mar. 5, 2014, Madison, WI

www.lifenews.com/2014/03/10/planned-parenthood-injuries-two-women-in-abortions-armored-car-picks-up-cash-afterwards/

Mar. 12, 2014, Boston, MA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/six-emergency-vehicles-swarm-boston-planned-parenthood-during-medical-emergency/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/police-report-woman-unresponsive-after-abortion-at-boston-planned-parenthood/ (incl. link to police report); www.lifenews.com/2014/03/14/ambulances-surround-planned-parenthood-as-woman-injured-during-abortion/

Mar. 21, 2014, Cleveland, OH

www.lifesitenews.com/news/abortion-death-911-record-show-cleveland-abortion-patient-not-breathing-at (incl. video with 911 call) www.lifenews.com/2014/03/26/woman-dies-after-botched-legal-abortion-frantic-911-call-shes-not-breathing-at-all/ (incl. video with 911 call); <http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/Wilson-Preterm-Record.pdf> (medical record); www.lifenews.com/2017/03/23/woman-died-from-botched-23-week-abortion-after-she-lost-so-much-blood-she-went-into-shock/ (follow-up report incl. 911 call)

Mar. 27, 2014, Albuquerque, NM

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulances-transport-two-patients-from-nations-largest-late-term-abortion-clinic-in-albuquerque/; www.lifenews.com/2014/03/28/ambulances-rush-to-nations-largest-late-term-abortion-clinic-after-two-botched-abortions/

Apr. 12, 2014, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Apr. 16, 2014, Dallas, TX

www.lifenews.com/2014/06/02/1000-texas-women-hospitalized-every-year-after-botched-abortions/ (incl. video)

Apr. 26, 2014, Bellevue, NE

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-rushes-seventh-carhart-abortion-patient-in-two-years-to-hospital/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/carhart-worker-to-911-we-had-an-issue-with-the-procedure/ (incl. 911 call)

June 3, 2014, Port Charlotte, FL

www.operationrescue.org/archives/florida-abortionist-harms-two-abortion-patients-on-same-day-one-hospitalized/

June 21, 2014, Nashville, TN

www.lifenews.com/2014/10/31/tennessee-medical-doctor-reveals-why-he-supports-amendment-1/ (incl. video with 911 call)

July 2, 2014, Germantown, MD

www.operationrescue.org/archives/carhart-strikes-again-african-american-woman-suffers-8th-abortion-related-medical-emergency-in-2-years/ (incl. video); www.operationrescue.org/archives/carhart-botched-abortion-cover-up-maryland-officials-attempt-to-silence-operation-rescue/ (incl. 911 calls)

July 10, 2014, St. Louis, MO

<http://liveactionnews.org/ambulance-takes-patient-away-under-covered-sheets-from-planned-parenthood-abortion-center/>; www.lifenews.com/2014/07/14/planned-parenthood-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion-hides-victim-with-sheets/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/st-louis-planned-parenthood-further-endangers-abortion-patient-by-calling-slower-private-ambulance-during-medical-emergency/

Sept. 4, 2014, Jacksonville, FL

www.operationrescue.org/archives/missing-911-call-ambulance-rushes-sobbing-abortion-patient-from-shoddy-florida-clinic/ (incl. video)

Oct. 25, 2014, Aurora, IL

<http://lifedynamics.com/ambulance-called-planned-parenthood-botched-abortion/> (incl. video with 911 call); www.lifenews.com/2014/11/17/planned-parenthood-botches-abortion-woman-rushed-to-hospital-after-massive-blood-loss/ (same)

Nov. 12, 2014, St. Louis, MO

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-transport-27th-women-from-st-louis-planned-parenthood-abortion-center/

Nov. 14, 2014, Salem, OR

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-transport-salem-planned-parenthood-patient/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/abortionist-places-bizarre-911-call-with-shocking-ending/ (incl. 911 call)

Dec. 11, 2014, Dayton, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/double-trouble-ambulances-transport-two-women-in-one-day-from-haskells-dayton-late-term-abortion-clinic/ (two ambulances)

Dec. 19, 2014, Albuquerque, NM

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-video-seventeenth-known-medical-emergency-at-new-mexico-late-term-abortion-clinic/ (incl. video)

Dec. 19, 2014, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2014/12/23/chicago-abortion-clinic-that-killed-four-women-in-abortions-injures-three-women-in-two-days/ (two ambulances)

Dec. 20, 2014, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2014/12/23/chicago-abortion-clinic-that-killed-four-women-in-abortions-injures-three-women-in-two-days/

2015

Jan. 7, 2015, Spokane, WA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/spokane-planned-parenthood-workers-laugh-as-suffering-woman-loaded-into-an-ambulance/

Jan. 17, 2015, San Diego, CA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/woman-who-rejected-help-from-pro-life-activists-rushed-by-ambulance-from-san-diego-abortion-facility/

Jan. 31, 2015, Houston, TX

www.breitbart.com/texas/2015/03/04/five-women-injured-in-4-weeks-during-botched-abortions-at-houston-planned-parenthood-clinics/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/protest-thursday-four-911-recordings-describe-abortion-related-complications-at-texas-planned-parenthood/ (incl. 911 call)

Feb. 3, 2015, Bakersfield, CA

<http://lifedynamics.com/ambulance-transfers-patient-california-abortion-clinic/>; www.lifenews.com/2015/02/04/clinic-workers-applaud-as-woman-put-in-ambulance-after-botched-abortion/

Feb. 6, 2015, Houston, TX

www.breitbart.com/texas/2015/03/04/five-women-injured-in-4-weeks-during-botched-abortions-at-houston-planned-parenthood-clinics/; <https://www.facebook.com/100578081394/videos/10152755286961395/> (911 call)

Feb. 7, 2015, Little Rock, AR

www.lifenews.com/2015/02/11/abortion-clinics-injure-four-women-in-botched-abortions-in-one-weekend/;
https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Feb. 7, 2015, Riverside, CA

www.lifenews.com/2015/02/11/abortion-clinics-injure-four-women-in-botched-abortions-in-one-weekend/

Feb. 7, 2015, Akron, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/lights-and-sirens-woman-rushed-to-er-from-akron-abortion-facility/ (incl. video); www.lifenews.com/2015/02/09/lights-and-sirens-blare-as-woman-rushed-to-hospital-after-botched-abortion/ (incl. video); www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-call-cannula-tore-hole-in-uterus-during-botched-abortion-at-troubled-akron-clinic/ (incl. video with 911 call)

Feb. 19, 2015, Pensacola, FL

<http://40daysforlifepensacola.com/2015/02/911/> (video with 911 recording included); www.lifenews.com/2015/02/23/abortion-clinic-owner-kicked-out-of-other-states-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion-in-florida/ (incl. video)

Feb. 25, 2015, Houston, TX

www.breitbart.com/texas/2015/03/04/five-women-injured-in-4-weeks-during-botched-abortions-at-houston-planned-parenthood-clinics/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/protest-thursday-four-911-recordings-describe-abortion-related-complications-at-texas-planned-parenthood/ (incl. 911 call)

Feb. 26, 2015, Houston, TX

www.breitbart.com/texas/2015/03/04/five-women-injured-in-4-weeks-during-botched-abortions-at-houston-planned-parenthood-clinics/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/protest-thursday-four-911-recordings-describe-abortion-related-complications-at-texas-planned-parenthood/ (incl. 911 call)

Feb. 28, 2015, Houston, TX

<https://www.facebook.com/video.php?v=10152755487901395> (911 call)

Mar. 7, 2015, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2015/03/16/planned-parenthood-patient-seen-wailing-and-grimacing-in-pain-after-botched-abortion/

Mar. 11, 2015, Little Rock, AR

<http://plal.org/hotline/2015/littlerockambulance/> (incl. video with 911 call); www.lifenews.com/2015/04/06/abortion-clinic-delays-calling-9-11-to-cover-up-botched-abortion-she-would-have-died-anyway/; https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Mar. 12, 2015, Ann Arbor, MI

www.operationrescue.org/archives/no-sirens-please-two-ambulances-within-60-days-at-michigan-planned-parenthood/ (incl. 911 call)

Mar. 20, 2015, Cleveland, OH

www.lifenews.com/2015/03/23/ambulance-rushes-to-abortion-clinic-that-killed-woman-in-botched-abortion-one-year-ago/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/911-recordings-reveal-new-details-of-two-more-abortion-complications-at-preterm-where-lakisha-wilson-died/ (incl. 911 call)

Mar. 26, 2015, Wichita, KS

www.lifenews.com/2015/07/06/abortion-clinic-refuses-ambulance-for-woman-hemorrhaging-after-botched-abortion/ (incl. video with 911 call); www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-transport-patient-from-wichita-abortion-clinic-in-former-tiller-building/ (incl. video)

Mar. 27, 2015, Bedford Heights, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/details-surface-of-two-medical-emergencies-at-an-ohio-planned-parenthood/ (with link to incident report)

Mar. 31, 2015, Bakersfield, CA

<http://lifedynamics.com/man-begs-911-help-wife-abortion/> (incl. video with 911 call); www.lifenews.com/2015/04/01/abortion-clinic-in-california-botches-abortion-tries-to-hide-victim-with-sheets/

Apr. 14, 2015, Bakersfield, CA

<http://lifedynamics.com/third-ambulance-called-california-abortion-clinic-past-months/>; <http://lifedynamics.com/abortion-doctor-to-911-we-need-someone-immediately/> (911 call)

Apr. 15, 2015, Spokane, WA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-transport-planned-parenthood-patient-on-abortionists-first-day-on-the-job/ (incl. video); www.lifenews.com/2015/05/18/planned-parenthood-staffer-calls-911-in-panic-after-botched-abortion-we-cant-stop-the-bleeding/ (incl. video with 911 call)

Apr. 24, 2015, Cleveland, OH

[https://saynsumthn.wordpress.com/2015/04/27/woman-leaves-abortion-clinic-in-ambulance-wrapped-like-a-mummy/\(incl. video\);](https://saynsumthn.wordpress.com/2015/04/27/woman-leaves-abortion-clinic-in-ambulance-wrapped-like-a-mummy/(incl. video);) www.lifenews.com/2015/04/27/watch-abortionist-sends-woman-wrapped-like-a-mummy-to-hospital-after-botched-abortion/ (incl. video); www.operationrescue.org/archives/911-recordings-reveal-new-details-of-two-more-abortion-complications-at-preterm-where-lakisha-wilson-died/ (incl. video with 911 call)

Apr. 30, 2015, Aurora, IL

www.lifenews.com/2015/04/30/ambulance-transport-woman-screaming-in-agony-from-planned-parenthood-to-hospital/ (incl. video)

May 9, 2015, Ann Arbor, MI

www.operationrescue.org/archives/no-sirens-please-two-ambulances-within-60-days-at-michigan-planned-parenthood/ (incl. video)

May 11, 2015, Bedford Heights, OH

www.operationrescue.org/archives/details-surface-of-two-medical-emergencies-at-an-ohio-planned-parenthood/ (incl. link to incident report)

June 6, 2015, Orlando, FL

www.operationrescue.org/archives/african-american-woman-leaves-worst-abortion-clinic-in-nation-in-an-ambulance/

June 11, 2015, Dayton, OH

www.lifenews.com/2016/08/01/late-term-abortion-clinic-did-abortion-on-drug-impaired-womans-baby-without-her-consent/

June 26, 2015, Ann Arbor, MI

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZfI6jIeIu2I> (video at 1:31)

July 3, 2015, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

July 14, 2015, Bakersfield, CA

<http://lifedynamics.com/4th-ambulance-called-abortion-clinic-mentioned-planned-parenthood-video/>

July 15, 2015, San Bernardino, CA

www.lifenews.com/2015/07/24/woman-hemorrhages-possibly-dies-from-botched-abortion-at-california-abortion-clinic/ (incl. video with 911 call)

July 16, 2015, Bloomington, IN

www.operationrescue.org/archives/bleeding-woman-at-indiana-planned-parenthood-spotlights-frequently-minimized-abortion-dangers/ (incl. 911 call)

July 16, 2015, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Aug. 4, 2015, Houston, TX

www.lifenews.com/2015/08/04/ambulance-rushed-after-botched-abortion-to-planned-parenthood-clinic-exposed-selling-aborted-babies/; www.lifenews.com/2015/10/06/planned-parenthood-worker-caught-selling-aborted-babys-eyeballs-calls-911-after-botched-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

Aug. 21, 2015, Brookline, MA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/massachusetts-abortionist-experiments-on-fresh-brains-of-down-syndrome-babies/

Sept. 5, 2015, San Diego, CA
www.lifenews.com/2015/09/14/woman-reportedly-dies-after-botched-abortion-at-family-planning-associates-clinic-in-san-diego/; www.lifenews.com/2015/09/18/moms-premonition-saves-life-of-a-woman-who-almost-died-from-a-botched-abortion/

Sept. 10, 2015, Kalamazoo, MI
www.lifenews.com/2016/06/14/planned-parenthood-asks-ambulance-to-turn-off-lights-and-sirens-to-hide-botched-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

Sept. 12, 2015, Cherry Hill, NJ
www.lifenews.com/2016/09/14/woman-bleeds-uncontrollably-after-botched-abortion-we-need-an-ambulance-right-now/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

Sept. 16, 2015, Spokane, WA
www.operationrescue.org/archives/safety-claims-questioned-spokane-planned-parenthood-tears-hole-in-abortion-patients-womb/ (incl. 911 call)

Sept. 18, 2015, Little Rock, AR
https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Oct. 3, 2015, Little Rock, AR
https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Oct. 7, 2015, York, PA
<http://greaterfitchburgforlife.blogspot.com/2015/10/day-29-call-ambulance-forty-days-for.html>

Oct. 9, 2015, Columbus, OH
www.lifenews.com/2015/12/08/planned-parenthood-botches-abortion-woman-has-sheet-over-her-head-heading-to-ambulance/ (incl. video with 911 call)

Oct. 14, 2015, New York City, NY

www.lifenews.com/2017/01/24/planned-parenthood-injuries-woman-in-botched-abortion-put-in-ambulance-under-healthcare-happens-sign/

Oct. 22, 2015, Detroit, MI

<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/SOTSDALE-MEDICAL-EMERGENCY-911-OCT-22-2015.pdf> (CAD report)

Nov. 4, 2015, Beverly Hills, CA

<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/sel-etz-911-doc4-NOV-4-and-4-2015-EMS-INJURY.pdf> (CAD report)

Dec. 2, 2015, Beverly Hills, CA

<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/sel-etz-911-DECEMBER-2-2015-EMS-CALL.pdf> (CAD report)

Dec. 15, 2015, Germantown, MD

www.lifenews.com/2015/12/18/late-term-abortionist-rushes-woman-to-hospital-after-injuring-her-in-botched-legal-abortion/ (incl. video)

2016

Jan. 5, 2016, Annapolis, MD

www.lifenews.com/2016/02/25/planned-parenthood-cited-for-not-sterilizing-equipment-hospitalizes-woman-after-botched-abortion/ (incl. 911 report)

Jan. 8, 2016, Denver, CO

<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/Denver-PP.pdf> (incident report)

Jan. 13, 2016, Kansas City, KS

https://www.scribd.com/document/343444355/Medical-Emergencies-at-Planned-Parenthood-Facilities-Jan-2016-March-2017#from_embed

Jan. 19, 2016, Germantown, MD

www.lifenews.com/2016/01/22/abortion-doc-who-killed-woman-in-botched-abortion-injures-another-woman/ (incl. video); www.lifenews.com/2016/02/08/he-injured-a-woman-in-a-botched-abortion-then-put-his-suitcase-in-the-car-as-ambulance-dove-away/ (incl. 911 call); www.lifenews.com/2016/10/25/botched-late-term-abortion-dismembers-a-baby-and-ripped-up-a-womans-womb-almost-killing-her/ (incl. link to and details from malpractice lawsuit)

Jan. 30, 2016, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2016/02/02/planned-parenthood-clinic-injures-30th-woman-in-botched-abortion-hides-victim-with-sheet/

Feb. 4, 2016, Bellevue, NE

www.lifenews.com/2016/02/08/he-injured-a-woman-in-a-botched-abortion-then-put-his-suitcase-in-the-car-as-ambulance-dove-away/; www.lifenews.com/2016/02/10/abortionist-botches-18-week-abortion-appears-to-leave-part-of-baby-inside-mothers-womb/ (incl. video & 911 call)

Feb. 10, 2016, Chicago, IL

http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/CADs-from-Multiple-Emergencies-PP-on-LaSalle-in-Chicago_Redacted.pdf (police event report)

Feb. 13, 2016, Cleveland, OH

www.lifenews.com/2016/03/03/abortion-clinic-that-kill-ed-woman-in-botched-abortion-injures-woman-in-botched-21-week-abortion/ (incl. video & 911 call); www.lifenews.com/2016/03/10/woman-had-to-be-carried-down-two-flights-of-stairs-after-clinic-injured-her-in-botched-abortion/ (incl. EMS & fire incident records)

Feb. 17, 2016, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Feb. 20, 2016, San Bernardino, CA

https://www.scribd.com/document/343444355/Medical-Emergencies-at-Planned-Parenthood-Facilities-Jan-2016-March-2017#from_embed

Feb. 23, 2016, Bakersfield, CA

www.lifenews.com/2016/02/25/abortion-activist-assaults-pro-lifer-trying-to-document-botched-abortion-injuring-woman/; www.lifenews.com/2016/03/15/abortion-biz-didnt-call-911-for-injured-patient-but-called-to-make-false-report-on-pro-lifers/ (incl. 911 calls collateral to ambulance)

Feb. 25, 2016, Silver Spring, MD

www.operationrescue.org/archives/no-gurney-barely-able-to-walk-planned-parenthood-patient-is-lifted-into-ambulance/ (incl. 911 call)

Feb. 29, 2016, Dallas, TX

www.lifenews.com/2016/03/01/texas-clinic-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion-as-supreme-court-holds-hearing-on-pro-life-law/

Mar. 1, 2016, New York City, NY

www.lifenews.com/2017/01/24/planned-parenthood-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion-put-in-ambulance-under-healthcare-happens-sign/

Mar. 20, 2016, Germantown, MD

www.lifenews.com/2016/03/23/late-term-abortionist-leroy-carhart-sends-4-women-to-hospital-in-4-months-after-botched-abortions/ (video included);
www.lifenews.com/2016/04/08/late-term-abortionist-almost-kills-woman-were-having-bad-vitals-we-need-someone-now/ (incl. 911 call)

Mar. 23, 2016, Chicago, IL

http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/CADs-from-Multiple-Emergencies-PP-on-LaSalle-in-Chicago_Redacted.pdf (police event report)

Mar. 30, 2016, Germantown, MD

www.lifenews.com/2016/04/01/late-term-abortionist-rushes-woman-to-hospital-after-injuring-her-on-4th-day-of-27-week-abortion/ (incl. video)

Apr. 4, 2016, Germantown, MD

www.operationrescue.org/archives/6-in-5-months-carharts-hemorrhaging-late-term-abortion-patient-transported-to-hospital/ (incl. video & 911 call)

Apr. 7, 2016, Chicago, IL

http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/CADs-from-Multiple-Emergencies-PP-on-LaSalle-in-Chicago_Redacted.pdf (police event report)

Apr. 15, 2016, Denver, CO

<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/Denver-PP.pdf> (incident report)

Apr. 15, 2016, Wichita, KS

www.lifenews.com/2016/04/29/abortion-clinic-injures-another-woman-in-botched-abortion-forced-to-send-him-to-hospital/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD transcript)

Apr. 25, 2016, Chicago, IL

http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/CADs-from-Multiple-Emergencies-PP-on-LaSalle-in-Chicago_Redacted.pdf (police event report)

May 13, 2016, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2016/05/17/st-louis-planned-parent-hood-clinic-hospitalizes-31st-abortion-patient-in-7-years/

May 21, 2016, Chicago, IL

http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/CADs-from-Multiple-Emergencies-PP-on-LaSalle-in-Chicago_Redacted.pdf (police event report)

June 15, 2016, Charlotte, NC

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/

June 16, 2016, Chicago, IL

http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/CADs-from-Multiple-Emergencies-PP-on-LaSalle-in-Chicago_Redacted.pdf (police event report)

June 29, 2016, Beverly Hills, CA

<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/SELETZ-INCIDENT-REPORT-1.pdf> (CAD report)

July 2, 2016, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2016/07/05/planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-sends-its-60th-botched-abortion-victim-to-the-er/

July 19, 2016, Bakersfield, CA

www.lifenews.com/2016/07/27/unsafe-eleventh-woman-rushed-to-hospital-from-bakersfield-abortion-facility/;

www.lifenews.com/2016/08/08/abortionist-said-prove-it-when-confronted-about-his-botched-abortion-so-heres-the-911-call/ (incl. 911 call)

July 22, 2016, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

July 27, 2016, Cherry Hill, NJ

www.lifenews.com/2016/09/14/woman-bleeds-uncontrollably-after-botched-abortion-we-need-an-ambulance-right-now/ (incl. video & link to CAD report)

Aug. 9, 2016, Madison, WI

www.lifenews.com/2016/08/25/government-covers-up-botched-abortion-at-planned-parenthood-that-put-woman-in-hospital/ (incl. audio & link to CAD report)

Aug. 13, 2016, Denver, CO

www.lifenews.com/2016/08/15/planned-parenthood-rushes-woman-to-hospital-with-massive-bleeding-after-botched-abortion/ (incl. Fire Department radio message); <http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/Denver-PP.pdf> (incident report)

Aug. 26, 2016, Worcester, MA

www.lifenews.com/2016/08/29/planned-parenthood-botches-another-abortion-witness-describes-panic-inside-clinic/

Aug. 29, 2016, Chicago, IL

http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/CADs-from-Multiple-Emergencies-PP-on-LaSalle-in-Chicago_Redacted.pdf (police event report)

Sept. 3, 2016, Charlotte, NC

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/

Sept. 28, 2016, New York, NY

https://www.scribd.com/document/343444355/Medical-Emergencies-at-Planned-Parenthood-Facilities-Jan-2016-March-2017#from_embed

Oct. 4, 2016, Annapolis, MD

www.lifenews.com/2016/10/05/woman-walked-into-a-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-yesterday-but-she-didnt-walk-out/ (incl. video & 911 call)

Oct. 19, 2016, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2016/10/21/st-louis-planned-parent-hood-botches-its-61st-abortion-in-7-years/

Oct. 19, 2016 Portland, OR

www.lifenews.com/2016/10/24/teen-rushed-to-hospital-after-late-term-abortion-clinic-loses-power-has-no-backup-generator/

Nov. 1, 2016 Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2017/03/03/shocking-911-call-planned-parent-hood-abortion-clinic-staff-gives-dispatcher-wrong-patients-information/ (incl. 911 call); http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/CADs-from-Multiple-Emergencies-PP-on-LaSalle-in-Chicago_Redacted.pdf (police event report)

Nov. 2, 2016, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2016/11/03/this-one-planned-parent-hood-abortion-clinic-has-hospitalized-62-women-after-botched-abortions/ (incl. video)

Nov. 3, 2016, Denver, CO

<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/Denver-PP.pdf> (incident report)

Nov. 4, 2016, New York City, NY

www.operationrescue.org/archives/planned-parenthoods-very-bad-week/

Nov. 4, 2016, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Nov. 23, 2016, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2016/12/16/most-dangerous-planned-parenthood-clinic-in-america-injures-a-woman-in-an-abortion-every-42-days/

Nov. 30, 2016, Cleveland, OH

www.lifenews.com/2016/12/05/abortion-clinic-refuses-to-call-911-after-visibly-pregnant-woman-injured-in-abortion/

Dec. 3, 2016, Detroit, MI

www.lifenews.com/2016/12/05/abortion-clinic-refuses-to-call-911-after-visibly-pregnant-woman-injured-in-abortion/

Dec. 7, 2016, St. Paul, MN

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r19sW5VBA-U&feature=youtu.be> (video at 3:17-3:33)

2017

Jan. 10, 2017, Bakersfield, CA

www.lifenews.com/2017/01/11/dead-or-alive-abortion-clinic-patient-taken-to-ambulance-wrapped-in-sheet-like-a-mummy/ (incl. video)

Jan. 12, 2017, Dallas, TX

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-transport-woman-with-breathing-difficulties-from-unsanitary-abortion-center/ (incl. 911 call)

Jan. 18, 2017, New York City, NY

www.lifenews.com/2017/01/24/planned-parenthood-injuries-woman-in-botched-abortion-put-in-ambulance-under-healthcare-happens-sign/

Feb. 4, 2017, New York City, NY

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-transport-2nd-woman-in-3-weeks-from-the-margaret-sanger-center-planned-parenthood/

Feb. 4, 2017, Bakersfield, CA

www.lifenews.com/2017/02/07/abortionist-botches-two-abortions-in-one-hour-both-women-rushed-by-ambulance-to-local-hospital/ (two incidents; video included)

Feb. 7, 2017, Germantown, MD

www.lifenews.com/2017/02/08/on-anniversary-of-killing-woman-in-33-week-abortion-leroy-carhart-sends-another-woman-to-hospital/ (incl. video)

Feb. 9, 2017, New York City, NY

www.lifenews.com/2017/02/10/planned-parenthood-clinic-named-for-margaret-sanger-hurts-2-women-in-3-weeks-in-botched-abortions/

Feb. 15, 2017, Stamford, CT

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r19sW5VBA-U&feature=youtu.be> (911 call at 4:01-4:18)

Feb. 15, 2017, Jacksonville, FL

www.operationrescue.org/archives/ambulance-transport-patient-from-naf-abortion-facility-in-jacksonville-florida/ (incl. 911 call)

Feb. 18, 2017, Bakersfield, CA

www.lifenews.com/2017/02/20/abortion-clinic-rushes-woman-to-hospital-after-botching-4th-abortion-in-5-weeks/ (incl. video)

Feb. 23, 2017, Mobile, AL

www.lifenews.com/2017/02/27/planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-that-failed-inspections-injures-another-woman-in-botched-abortion/ (incl. video & 911 call)

Mar. 2, 2017, Virginia Beach, VA

www.lifenews.com/2017/04/05/planned-parenthood-hospitalizes-two-women-after-botched-abortions-abortionist-left-to-abort-more-babies/

Mar. 3, 2017, New York City, NY

www.lifenews.com/2017/03/06/planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-named-for-margaret-sanger-dumps-botched-abortion-victim-in-wheelchair/

Mar. 3, 2017, Santa Cruz, CA

www.lifenews.com/2017/03/15/planned-parenthood-clinic-as-botched-so-many-abortions-its-called-911-22-times-in-13-months/

Mar. 11, 2017, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2017/03/13/one-planned-parenthood-clinic-has-injured-women-in-64-botched-abortions-has-39-health-violations/

Mar. 17, 2017, Ann Arbor, MI

www.lifenews.com/2017/03/22/another-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-botches-another-abortion-requiring-another-ambulance/

Mar. 22, 2017, Fargo, ND

www.lifenews.com/2017/03/24/paramedics-forced-to-wheel-woman-injured-in-botched-abortion-through-back-alley-of-trash-and-dumpsters/

Mar. 24, 2017, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2017/03/29/safety-crisis-planned-parenthood-in-st-louis-hospitalizes-65th-patient-from-botched-abortion/

Mar. 24, 2017, Bellevue, NE

www.lifenews.com/2017/03/27/abortionist-who-killed-a-woman-in-a-botched-abortion-injures-another-in-abortion-at-17-weeks/ (incl. video & 911 call)

Mar. 28, 2017, Boston, MA

www.lifenews.com/2017/04/05/planned-parenthood-hospitalizes-two-women-after-botched-abortions-abortionist-left-to-abort-more-babies/; www.operationrescue.org/archives/911-records-boston-planned-parenthood-patient-suffered-post-abortion-hemorrhage/ (update referencing 911 records)

Mar. 29, 2017, New York, NY

<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/Medical-Emergency-At-Margaret-Sanger-Planned-Parenthood-Abortion-Facility.pdf>

Apr. 1, 2017, Fayetteville, NC

www.lifenews.com/2017/04/10/planned-parenthood-has-rushed-13-women-to-the-er-after-botched-abortions-in-2017-that-we-know-of/ (incl. video); <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LOf5V32us5I> (video)

Apr. 1, 2017, Tempe, AZ

www.lifenews.com/2017/04/21/abortion-activists-block-attempt-to-record-ambulance-at-planned-parenthood-after-botched-abortion/ (incl. video)

Apr. 7, 2017, Virginia Beach, VA

www.lifenews.com/2017/04/24/virginia-beach-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-hospitalizes-second-woman-in-a-month/ (incl. 911 call)

Apr. 18, 2017, Beverly Hills, CA

www.lifenews.com/2017/12/11/abortionist-to-the-stars-botches-two-late-term-abortions-tells-911-injured-woman-had-a-fetal-demise/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD); www.operationrescue.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/SELETZ-911-CAD-APRIL-18-2017.pdf (CAD report)

May 3, 2017, Beverly Hills, CA

www.lifenews.com/2017/12/11/abortionist-to-the-stars-botches-two-late-term-abortions-tells-911-injured-woman-had-a-fetal-demise/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD); www.operationrescue.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/SELETZ-911-CAD-MAY-3-2017.pdf (CAD report)

May 12, 2017, Dover, DE

www.lifenews.com/2017/05/15/planned-parenthood-refuses-to-call-ambulance-for-woman-in-pain-after-botched-abortion/ (sent to ER in private car instead)

May 13, 2017, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2017/05/16/planned-parenthood-main-abortion-clinic-has-injured-4-women-in-botched-abortions-already-this-year/

May 24, 2017, New York, NY

www.operationrescue.org/archives/margaret-sanger-planned-parenthood-seriously-botches-abortion-that-fiance-tried-to-prevent/

May 24, 2017, Stamford, CT

www.lifenews.com/2017/05/26/woman-loses-consciousness-after-planned-parenthood-killed-her-baby-in-an-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

June 7, 2017, Bremerton, WA

www.lifenews.com/2017/06/22/family-watches-in-agony-as-woman-taken-by-ambulance-from-planned-parenthood-after-botched-abortion/ (incl. video)

June 17, 2017, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

July 7 2017, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2017/07/11/planned-parenhoods-hq-abortion-clinic-injures-its-seventh-woman-this-year-in-a-botched-abortion/

July 19, 2017, New York City, NY

www.lifenews.com/2017/07/25/planned-parenthood-headquarters-injures-two-more-women-in-botched-abortions/ (incl. video)

July 26, 2017, Cleveland, OH

www.lifenews.com/2017/07/28/abortion-facility-that-killed-lakisha-in-botched-abortion-wilson-hospitals-another-woman/

July 27, 2017, Cincinnati, OH

www.lifenews.com/2017/08/02/woman-goes-into-seizures-after-botched-abortion-at-planned-parenthood-clinic/ (incl. 911 call)

Aug. 4, 2017, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2017/08/10/planned-parenthood-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion-and-hides-victim-with-sheets/

Aug. 19, 2017, Bakersfield, CA

www.operationrescue.org/archives/abortionist-with-mental-health-history-sends-5th-patient-to-hospital-this-year/ (incl. video)

Sept. 16, 2017, Charlotte, NC

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/

Sept. 29, 2017, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2017/10/19/if-abortion-is-safe-why-have-51-ambulances-rushed-to-abortion-clinics-after-botched-abortions-this-year/

Sept. 30, 2017, Cleveland, OH

www.lifenews.com/2017/10/02/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-a-botched-legal-abortion-injures-another-woman/

Oct. 2, 2017, Omaha, NE

www.lifenews.com/2017/10/19/if-abortion-is-safe-why-have-51-ambulances-rushed-to-abortion-clinics-after-botched-abortions-this-year/

Oct. 3, 2017, Houston, TX

www.lifenews.com/2017/10/19/if-abortion-is-safe-why-have-51-ambulances-rushed-to-abortion-clinics-after-botched-abortions-this-year/

Oct. 3, 2017, Bakersfield, CA

www.lifenews.com/2017/10/05/woman-nearly-dies-after-botched-abortion-perforates-her-uterus/ (incl. video)

Oct. 4, 2017, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/28/women-suffer-from-seizure-massive-bleeding-after-botched-abortions-at-chicago-planned-parenthood/ (incl. 911 call)

Oct. 4, 2017, Houston, TX

www.lifenews.com/2017/10/19/if-abortion-is-safe-why-have-51-ambulances-rushed-to-abortion-clinics-after-botched-abortions-this-year/

Oct. 6, 2017, Bellevue, NE

www.lifenews.com/2017/10/19/if-abortion-is-safe-why-have-51-ambulances-rushed-to-abortion-clinics-after-botched-abortions-this-year/ (incl. video)

Oct. 6, 2017, Walnut Creek, CA

www.lifenews.com/2017/10/19/if-abortion-is-safe-why-have-51-ambulances-rushed-to-abortion-clinics-after-botched-abortions-this-year/

Oct. 13, 2017, Raleigh, NC

www.lifenews.com/2017/10/19/if-abortion-is-safe-why-have-51-ambulances-rushed-to-abortion-clinics-after-botched-abortions-this-year/

Oct. 21, 2017, Hartford, CT

www.lifenews.com/2017/11/20/woman-rushed-to-hospital-with-sheet-over-her-head-after-botched-abortion-causes-excessive-bleeding/ (incl. 911 call & print-out);
www.lifenews.com/2017/11/28/dead-or-alive-disturbing-photos-show-woman-bound-to-gurney-after-botched-abortion/ (additional photos and 911 call)

Nov. 16, 2017, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/28/women-suffer-from-seizure-massive-bleeding-after-botched-abortions-at-chicago-planned-parenthood/ (incl. 911 call)

Nov. 16, 2017, Portland, OR

www.lifenews.com/2018/04/06/late-term-abortion-clinic-caught-botching-abortion-rushing-this-woman-to-hospital/

Nov. 18, 2017, Milwaukee, WI

www.lifenews.com/2017/11/27/what-this-abortion-clinic-did-after-a-botched-abortion-makes-claims-of-protecting-womens-health-a-total-joke/

Nov. 20, 2017 Bethesda, MD

www.lifenews.com/2018/03/22/late-term-abortion-clinic-suspected-of-selling-aborted-baby-parts-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion/

Dec. 1, 2017, Charlotte, NC

<https://www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/>

Dec. 2, 2017, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2017/12/05/planned-parenthood-hq-named-for-margaret-sanger-injures-black-woman-in-botched-abortion/

Dec. 26, 2017, Charlotte, NC

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/

2018

Jan. 4, 2018, Dayton, OH

www.lifenews.com/2018/01/05/just-four-days-into-2018-an-abortion-clinic-has-already-injured-a-woman-in-a-botched-abortion/

Jan. 17, 2018, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Jan. 17, 2018, Bakersfield, CA

www.lifenews.com/2018/01/25/abortionist-who-injured-6-women-in-botched-abortions-in-2017-injures-another-woman/

Jan. 27, 2018, Cherry Hill, NJ

www.lifenews.com/2018/03/01/abortion-clinic-botches-another-abortion-employs-doc-who-tried-to-force-his-girlfriend-to-abort-her-baby/

Feb. 1, 2018, Tempe, AZ

www.lifenews.com/2018/02/22/planned-parenthood-exposed-botching-another-abortion-rushes-woman-to-hospital/ (incl. video)

Feb. 3, 2018, Falls Church, VA

www.lifenews.com/2018/02/08/abortion-clinic-caught-not-cleaning-its-equipment-sends-woman-to-hospital-after-botched-abortion/ (incl. video)

Feb. 3, 2018, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/28/women-suffer-from-seizure-massive-bleeding-after-botched-abortions-at-chicago-planned-parenthood/ (incl. 911 call)

Feb. 15, 2018, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2018/02/20/planned-parenthood-hq-botches-abortion-on-african-american-woman-has-botched-10-abortions-in-13-months/

Feb. 24, 2018, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2018/02/26/this-planned-parenthood-clinic-has-called-an-ambulance-68-times-after-hurting-women-in-botched-abortions/

Feb. 27, 2018, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/28/women-suffer-from-seizure-massive-bleeding-after-botched-abortions-at-chicago-planned-parenthood/

Mar. 2, 2018, Portland, OR

www.lifenews.com/2018/04/06/late-term-abortion-clinic-caught-botching-abortion-rushing-this-woman-to-hospital/

Mar. 3, 2018, Little Rock, AR

https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officeP ark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Mar. 5, 2018, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2018/03/07/planned-parenthood-clinic-caught-injuring-woman-in-botched-abortion-11-days-after-it-hurt-another-woman/

Mar. 16, 2018, Charlotte, NC

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/09/abortion-clinic-that-killed-this-woman-in-botched-legal-abortion-injures-at-least-20-more-women/

Mar. 17, 2018, Cleveland, OH

www.lifenews.com/2018/03/29/clinic-staffer-attacks-elderly-pro-lifer-as-he-documented-how-it-injured-another-woman-during-abortion/; www.lifenews.com/2018/04/10/abortion-clinic-that-killed-woman-in-botched-abortion-injures-another-bleeding-so-heavily-it-wouldnt-stop/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

Mar. 21, 2018, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2018/07/30/abortion-clinic-botches-two-abortions-in-3-days-so-badly-women-suffer-massive-hemorrhaging/ (incl. 911 call)

Mar. 22, 2018, Orange, CA

www.lifenews.com/2018/03/26/planned-parenthood-clinic-photographed-loading-woman-into-ambulance-after-apparent-botched-abortion/

Mar. 24, 2018, Cleveland, OH

www.lifenews.com/2018/03/29/clinic-staffer-attacks-elderly-pro-lifer-as-he-documented-how-it-injured-another-woman-during-abortion/

Mar. 24, 2018, Chicago, IL

<https://www.lifenews.com/2018/07/30/abortion-clinic-botches-two-abortions-in-3-days-so-badly-women-suffer-massive-hemorrhaging/> (incl. 911 call)

Mar. 26, 2018, Orange, CA

www.lifenews.com/2018/03/28/planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-caught-selling-aborted-baby-parts-botches-2nd-abortion-in-four-days/

Mar. 30, 2018, Portland, OR

www.lifenews.com/2018/04/06/late-term-abortion-clinic-caught-botching-abortion-rushing-this-woman-to-hospital/

Mar. 31, 2018, Little Rock, AR

www.lifenews.com/2018/04/23/abortion-clinic-caught-injuring-woman-in-botched-abortion-has-injured-60-other-women-in-botched-abortions/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report); https://www.scribd.com/document/377065958/4officePark1999toArpil2018CADList-v2#from_embed

Apr. 5, 2018, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2018/04/20/why-did-planned-parenthood-clinic-call-two-ambulances-after-injuring-woman-in-botched-abortion/

Apr. 23, 2018, Beverly Hills, CA

www.lifenews.com/2018/06/07/abortionist-to-the-stars-covers-up-911-call-to-hide-how-badly-a-botched-abortion-injured-a-woman/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

May 4, 2018, Bellevue, NE

www.lifenews.com/2018/05/08/woman-ominously-covered-in-white-sheet-heading-into-ambulance-did-botched-abortion-kill-her/ (incl. video); www.lifenews.com/2018/05/29/late-term-abortionist-botched-abortion-so-badly-woman-lost-half-her-blood/ (incl. link to CAD report)

May 16, 2018, Beverly Hills, CA

www.lifenews.com/2018/07/16/abortion-clinic-to-the-stars-in-beverly-hills-kills-babies-throughout-all-9-months-of-pregnancy/ (incl. link to CAD report)

May 19, 2018, Boston, MA

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/21/boston-planned-parent-hood-abortion-clinic-has-hospitalized-10-women-in-last-12-months/ (with link to public records response)

May 22, 2018, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2018/06/19/911-call-catches-planned-parenthood-botching-abortion-admits-mother-is-bleeding-excessively/ (incl. 911 call)

May 25, 2018, Montgomery, AL

www.lifenews.com/2018/06/01/abortion-clinic-staffers-caught-carrying-woman-injured-by-abortion-to-private-car-instead-of-using-ambulance/

May 30, 2018, Boston, MA

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/21/boston-planned-parent-hood-abortion-clinic-has-hospitalized-10-women-in-last-12-months/ (with link to public records response)

July 3, 2018, Beverly Hills, CA

www.lifenews.com/2018/11/15/abortionist-to-the-stars-josefa-seletz-injures-two-women-at-her-beverly-hills-abortion-clinic/ (incl. link to CAD report); www.lifenews.com/2018/12/12/this-abortionist-kills-babies-up-to-birth-911-calls-expose-how-she-botched-two-abortions/ (incl. link to EMS record)

July 5, 2018, Boston, MA

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/21/boston-planned-parent-hood-abortion-clinic-has-hospitalized-10-women-in-last-12-months/ (with link to public records response)

July 5, 2018, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2018/10/09/planned-parent-hood-clinic-injures-two-women-in-botched-abortions-cant-stop-the-bleeding/ (incl. 911 call)

July 10, 2018, Beverly Hills, CA

www.lifenews.com/2018/11/15/abortionist-to-the-stars-josefa-seletz-injures-two-women-at-her-beverly-hills-abortion-clinic/ (incl. link to CAD report); www.lifenews.com/2018/12/12/this-abortionist-kills-babies-up-to-birth-911-calls-expose-how-she-botched-two-abortions/ (incl. 911 call & link to EMS record)

July 27, 2018, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2018/10/09/planned-parent-hood-clinic-injures-two-women-in-botched-abortions-cant-stop-the-bleeding/ (incl. 911 call)

July 29, 2018, Glendale, AZ

www.lifenews.com/2018/08/17/planned-parent-hood-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion-and-hides-victim-with-umbrellas/

Sept. 5, 2018, Cleveland, OH
www.lifenews.com/2018/09/12/abortion-clinic-that-kill-ed-woman-in-botched-abortion-sends-another-woman-to-hospital/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

Sept. 5, 2018, Chicago, IL
www.lifenews.com/2018/10/22/this-one-planned-parenthood-clinic-has-botched-8-abortions-with-women-bleeding-uncontrollably/ (incl. 911 call)

Sept. 7, 2018, Boston, MA
www.lifenews.com/2019/05/21/boston-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-has-hospitalized-10-women-in-last-12-months/ (with link to public records response)

Sept. 11, 2018, Boston, MA
www.lifenews.com/2019/05/21/boston-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-has-hospitalized-10-women-in-last-12-months/ (with link to public records response)

Sept. 11, 2018, Chicago, IL
www.lifenews.com/2018/10/22/this-one-planned-parenthood-clinic-has-botched-8-abortions-with-women-bleeding-uncontrollably/ (incl. 911 call)

Sept. 13, 2018, Beverly Hills, CA
www.lifenews.com/2019/01/29/listen-clinic-that-does-a-bortions-up-to-birth-calls-911-after-botched-abortion-leaves-woman-septic/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

Sept. 22, 2018, Greensboro, NC
www.lifenews.com/2018/11/30/city-covers-up-serious-medical-emergency-at-greensboro-north-carolina-abortion-business/

Oct. 6, 2018, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2018/11/26/planned-parenthood-th-at-killed-woman-in-botched-abortion-injures-teen-so-badly-she-needed-an-ambulance/ (incl. 911 call)

Oct. 12, 2018, Cherry Hill, NJ

www.lifenews.com/2018/10/16/abortion-clinic-downplays-botched-abortion-requiring-ambulance-to-911-calls-it-miscarrying/

Oct. 19, 2018, Boston, MA

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/21/boston-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-has-hospitalized-10-women-in-last-12-months/ (with link to public records response)

Oct. 20, 2018, Detroit, MI

<http://abortiondocs.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/scotsdale-oct-20-2018.pdf> (event report)

Oct. 26, 2018, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2018/10/29/planned-parenthood-hq-forced-to-call-ambulance-after-injuring-woman-in-botched-abortion/

Oct. 26, 2018, Wichita, KS

www.operationrescue.org/archives/911-recording-trust-women-abortion-mill-leaves-woman-lacerated-hemorrhaging/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

Nov. 2, 2018, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2018/11/05/just-one-planned-parenthood-clinic-has-injured-70-women-in-botched-abortions/

Nov. 3, 2018, Cuyahoga Fall, OH

www.lifenews.com/2018/12/03/abortion-clinic-uses-rainbow-umbrellas-to-try-to-hide-botched-abortion-injuring-another-woman/ (incl. link to report)

Nov. 9, 2018, Cleveland, OH
www.lifenews.com/2018/12/10/abortion-clinic-kicks-woman-out-at-closing-time-while-shes-hemorrhaging-from-her-abortion/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

Nov. 28, 2018, Boston, MA
www.lifenews.com/2019/05/21/boston-planned-parent-hood-abortion-clinic-has-hospitalized-10-women-in-last-12-months/ (with link to public records response)

Nov. 29, 2018, Washington, DC
www.lifenews.com/2019/04/10/planned-parenthood-clinic-rushes-woman-to-hospital-after-it-injures-her-in-botched-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

Dec. 1, 2018, Chicago, IL
www.lifenews.com/2018/12/19/woman-suffers-seizure-after-botched-abortion-heres-the-911-call-for-emergency-help/ (incl. 911 call)

Dec. 7, 2018, Baltimore, MD
www.lifenews.com/2019/01/23/panicked-woman-left-gasping-for-air-at-planned-parenthood-while-staff-refused-to-help/ (incl. 911 call)

Dec. 8, 2018, Westland, MI
www.lifenews.com/2019/03/13/woman-having-her-4th-abortion-has-her-uterus-perforated-she-may-never-have-children-again/ (incl. link to EMS report)

Dec. 14, 2018, Flossmoor, IL
www.lifenews.com/2019/02/28/listen-911-call-reveals-woman-bleeding-uncontrollably-after-planned-parent-hood-botches-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

Dec. 21, 2018 Bellevue, NE
www.lifenews.com/2018/12/27/abortionist-who-kills-babies-in-all-9-months-of-pregnancy-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

Dec. 24, 2018, Aurora, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/08/12/planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-hides-teen-girls-threat-to-kill-herself-from-her-parents/ (incl. 911 call & link to police report)

2019

Jan. 12, 2019, Aurora, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/08/21/planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-rushes-two-women-to-hospital-after-injuring-them-in-botched-abortions/ (incl. 911 call & police report)

Jan. 18, 2019, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2019/01/21/planned-parenthood-clinic-leana-wen-worked-at-just-injured-71st-woman-in-botched-abortion/

Jan. 24, 2019, Grand Rapids, MI

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/02/planned-parenthood-hangs-up-on-911-after-botched-abortion-as-patient-with-seizure-disorder-unable-to-breathe/ (incl. 911 call)

Jan. 25, 2019, Austin, TX

www.lifenews.com/2019/11/12/planned-parenthood-clinic-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion-downplays-uncontrolled-bleeding-to-911/ (incl. 911 call)

Jan. 29, 2019, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/03/06/listen-shocking-911-call-woman-chokes-on-her-own-vomit-after-abortion/ (incl. 911 calls)

Jan. 30, 2019, Bakersfield, CA

www.lifenews.com/2019/02/05/bakersfield-california-abortion-clinic-caught-injuring-20th-woman-in-6-years-after-botched-abortion/ (incl. video)

Feb. 4, 2019, Boston, MA

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/21/boston-planned-parent-hood-abortion-clinic-has-hospitalized-10-women-in-last-12-months/ (with link to public records response)

Feb. 7, 2019, Southfield, MI

www.lifenews.com/2019/04/03/911-call-woman-screams-in-agony-after-botched-abortion-perforates-her-uterus/ (incl. 911 call & link to patient care record)

Feb. 7, 2019, Dayton, OH

www.lifenews.com/2019/02/11/abortion-clinic-that-does-abortions-up-to-birth-calls-911-after-abortion-causes-seizure/ (incl. 911 call and link to EMS report)

Feb. 16, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/04/11/planned-parenthoods-hq-abortion-clinic-hospitalizes-5-women-in-7-weeks-after-botched-abortions/

Feb. 23, 2019, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/09/chicago-planned-parent-hood-injures-women-every-6-weeks-in-botched-abortions/

Mar. 6, 2019, Peoria, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/03/18/listen-abortion-clinic-tries-to-cover-up-details-of-botched-abortion-during-911-call/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report) [N.B. caller refused to give details because “we are an abortion clinic and it will be posted all over the internet”]

Mar. 6, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/03/28/planned-parenthood-hq-has-sent-15-women-in-26-months-to-hospital-after-botched-abortions/; www.lifenews.com/2019/04/11/planned-parenthoods-hq-abortion-clinic-hospitalizes-5-women-in-7-weeks-after-botched-abortions/

Mar. 7, 2019, Dayton, OH

www.lifenews.com/2019/03/12/watch-abortion-clinic-that-kills-babies-in-abortions-up-to-birth-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion/ (incl. 911 call, video, & link to incident report)

Mar. 12, 2019, Aurora, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/08/21/planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-rushes-two-women-to-hospital-after-injuring-them-in-botched-abortions/ (incl. 911 call & link to police report)

Mar. 13, 2019, Dallas, TX

www.lifenews.com/2019/10/24/abortion-clinic-botches-abortion-calls-911-for-ambulance-when-woman-hemorrhages/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

Mar. 15, 2019, Baton Rouge, LA

www.lifenews.com/2019/03/22/abortion-clinic-tied-to-kermit-gosnell-hospitalizes-woman-after-botched-abortion/; www.lifenews.com/2019/07/31/abortion-clinic-botched-abortion-so-badly-woman-had-to-have-emergency-surgery-hysterectomy/

Mar. 16, 2019, Detroit, MI

www.lifenews.com/2019/07/15/safe-legal-abortion-clinic-tear-hole-in-womans-uterus-while-killing-her-24-week-baby-in-abortion/

Mar. 21, 2019, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/09/chicago-planned-parenthood-injures-women-every-6-weeks-in-botched-abortions/

Mar. 22, 2019, Southfield, MI

www.lifenews.com/2019/04/29/abortion-clinic-kills-20-week-old-twin-babies-in-dismemberment-abortion-tearing-off-their-limbs/ (incl. 911 call & link to 911 records)

Mar. 27, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/04/11/planned-parenthoods-hq-abortion-clinic-hospitalizes-5-women-in-7-weeks-after-botched-abortions/

Mar. 29, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/04/11/planned-parenthoods-hq-abortion-clinic-hospitalizes-5-women-in-7-weeks-after-botched-abortions/

Mar. 29, 2019, Little Rock, AR

www.lifenews.com/2019/07/31/abortion-clinic-that-has-injured-60-women-in-botched-abortions-calls-911-again-after-hurting-another/ (incl. 911 call)

Apr. 2, 2019, Boulder, CO

www.lifenews.com/2019/04/04/abortion-clinic-that-kills-babies-up-to-birth-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion/ (incl. video); www.lifenews.com/2019/04/05/abortion-clinic-kills-33-week-old-baby-in-legal-abortion-fails-to-call-911-after-severely-injuring-mother/ (incl. link to CAD report)

Apr. 4, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/04/11/planned-parenthoods-hq-abortion-clinic-hospitalizes-5-women-in-7-weeks-after-botched-abortions/

Apr. 5, 2019, Cleveland, OH

www.lifenews.com/2019/04/17/abortion-clinic-that-killed-woman-in-botched-abortion-sends-another-woman-to-hospital-2/ (incl. video, 911 call, & link to report)

Apr. 17, 2019, Cleveland, OH

www.lifenews.com/2019/04/22/clinic-that-killed-woman-in-botched-abortion-calls-911-after-woman-bleeds-uncontrollably-from-late-abortion/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

Apr. 20, 2019, Boston, MA

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/21/boston-planned-parent-hood-abortion-clinic-has-hospitalized-10-women-in-las-t-12-months/ (with link to public records response)

Apr. 23, 2019, Boston, MA

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/21/boston-planned-parent-hood-abortion-clinic-has-hospitalized-10-women-in-las-t-12-months/ (with link to public records response)

Apr. 24, 2019, St. Louis, MO

<https://abortion911.com/number-72-another-ambulance-picks-up-injured-woman-at-troubled-st-louis-planned-parent-hood/>; www.operationrescue.org/archives/st-louis-planned-parent-hoods-new-deficiency-report-court-docs-reveal-obstruction-of-truth-in-horrifically-botched-abortions/

Apr. 25, 2019, Detroit, MI

www.lifenews.com/2019/07/15/safe-legal-abortion-clinic-tear-hole-in-womans-uterus-while-killing-her-24-week-baby-in-abortion/

Apr. 26, 2019, St. Louis, MO

<https://abortion911.com/number-73-and-counting-2nd-ambulance-in-3-days-spotted-at-st-louis-planned-parent-hood-americas-most-dangerous-abortion-clinic/>

Apr. 30, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/09/planned-parent-hood-hq-has-injured-six-women-in-botched-abortions-over-last-two-months/

May 10, 2019, Philadelphia, PA

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/14/planned-parent-hood-where-brian-sims-bullied-women-calls-911-for-botched-abortion-hours-after-huge-protest/ (incl. video)

60a

May 11, 2019, Hempstead, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/06/25/ny-planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-injures-woman-after-state-legalizing-abortions-up-to-birth/

May 11, 2019, Greensboro, NC

www.youtube.com/watch?v=_3sK6NO_alA (video & 911 call)

May 14, 2019, Walnut Creek, CA

<https://abortion911.com/hidden-health-crisis-planned-parenthood-hospitalizes-another-injured-woman-as-medical-emergencies-increase/> (incl. 911 call)

May 15, 2019, St. Louis, MO

www.lifenews.com/2019/05/23/planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-calls-3rd-ambulance-in-22-days-after-hurting-woman-in-botched-abortion/

May 31, 2019, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/06/13/as-illinois-legalizes-abortions-up-to-birth-chicago-clinic-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

June 7, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/06/14/planned-parenthood-headquarters-injures-7-women-in-botched-abortions-in-6-weeks/ (incl. video)

June 11, 2019, Providence, RI

www.lifenews.com/2019/10/10/woman-rushed-to-hospital-after-planned-parenthood-tears-hole-in-her-uterus-in-botched-abortion/; www.youtube.com/watch?v=P3Y3tx_kJqM (video & 911 call)

June 14, 2019, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/07/23/abortion-clinic-requests-no-lights-and-sirens-for-ambulance-to-hide-botched-abortions/

61a

June 25, 2019, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/07/23/abortion-clinic-requests-no-lights-and-sirens-for-ambulance-to-hide-botched-abortions/ (incl. 911 call)

July 16, 2019, Tacoma, WA

www.lifenews.com/2019/08/15/mom-takes-15-year-old-rape-victim-for-late-term-abortion-that-perforates-her-uterus/

July 31, 2019, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/09/05/abortionist-who-killed-woman-in-botched-abortion-apparently-injured-another-woman-in-failed-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

July 31, 2019, Wichita, KS

www.lifenews.com/2019/08/08/kansas-abortion-facility-puts-woman-at-risk-with-no-lights-or-sirens-on-ambulance-as-she-has-stroke/ (incl. video, 911 call, & link to CAD report)

Aug. 1, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/08/13/planned-parenthood-hq-has-injured-8-women-in-botched-abortions-this-year/

Aug. 6, 2019, Beverly Hills, CA

www.lifenews.com/2019/10/07/woman-found-lying-in-blood-on-operating-table-after-botched-abortion-dismembers-her-18-week-old-twins/ (incl. links to CAD report, incident report, & EMS report)

Aug. 14, 2019, St. Paul, MN

www.lifenews.com/2019/09/04/planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-injures-two-women-in-three-days-in-botched-abortions/ (incl. video)

Aug. 16, 2019, St. Paul, MN

www.lifenews.com/2019/09/04/planned-parenthood-abortion-clinic-injures-two-women-in-three-days-in-botched-abortions/

Aug. 17, 2019, Bronx, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/09/11/abortion-clinic-that-kills-babies-up-to-24-weeks-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion/

Aug. 22, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/09/09/planned-parenthood-headquarters-injures-9th-woman-in-botched-abortion-in-8-months/ (incl. video)

Aug. 28, 2019, Austin, TX

www.lifenews.com/2019/10/23/abortion-biz-wants-ambulance-to-run-with-no-sirens-to-cover-up-injuring-woman-in-botched-abortion/ (incl. link to CAD report); www.youtube.com/watch?v=0Lx2U-9x9WI (911 call)

Sept. 7, 2019, Chicago, IL

www.lifenews.com/2019/11/13/chicago-abortion-clinic-calls-911-for-5th-time-this-year-after-injuring-woman-in-botched-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

Sept. 11, 2019, Beverly Hills, CA

www.youtube.com/watch?v=Y9EIuyRlYhc (911 call)

Sept. 14, 2019, Cleveland, OH

www.lifenews.com/2019/09/16/abortion-clinic-that-has-killed-two-women-in-botched-abortions-injures-another-woman/ (incl. video); www.lifenews.com/2019/09/19/woman-hemorrhaged-drifted-out-of-consciousness-after-abortion-at-clinic-that-killed-two-women/ (incl. link to CAD report)

Sept. 21, 2019, Cherry Hill, NJ

www.lifenews.com/2019/10/01/dismemberment-abortion-kills-24-week-old-viable-unborn-baby-911-called-women-mother-injured-too/ (incl. 911 call)

Sept. 25, 2019, Cleveland, OH

www.lifenews.com/2019/09/30/abortion-clinic-that-killed-two-women-in-botched-abortions-sends-another-woman-to-hospital/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

Sept. 27, 2019, Jacksonville, FL

www.lifenews.com/2019/10/18/abortion-clinic-injured-woman-so-badly-in-botched-abortion-it-had-to-call-911-for-help/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

Sept. 28, 2019, Miami, FL

www.lifenews.com/2019/11/05/abortionist-who-killed-woman-in-botched-abortion-injures-another-in-botched-22-week-abortion/ (incl. video & link to CAD report)

Oct. 2, 2019, Baltimore, MD

www.lifenews.com/2019/10/16/planned-parenthood-tries-to-cover-up-botched-abortion-by-hiding-911-call-for-ambulance/ (incl. 911 call & link to CAD report)

Oct. 3, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/10/08/planned-parenthood-hq-injures-three-women-in-five-days-in-botched-abortions/

Oct. 5, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/10/08/planned-parenthood-hq-injures-three-women-in-five-days-in-botched-abortions/

Oct. 7, 2019, New York, NY

www.lifenews.com/2019/10/08/planned-parenthood-hq-injures-three-women-in-five-days-in-botched-abortions/

Oct. 30, 2019, Chicago, IL

www.youtube.com/watch?v=4DTuKHB4U5E (911 call)

64a

Nov. 14, 2019, New York, NY
www.lifenews.com/2019/11/18/planned-parenthood-hq-hospitalizes-13th-woman-this-year-after-injuring-her-in-botched-abortion/

Nov. 14, 2019, Cherry Hill, NJ
www.lifenews.com/2019/11/26/woman-was-bleeding-so-badly-after-botched-abortion-the-clinic-couldnt-stop-it/
(incl. 911 call)

Nov. 16, 2019, Aurora, IL
www.lifenews.com/2019/12/12/planned-parenthood-botched-abortion-so-badly-woman-is-hemorrhaging-and-maybe-not-breathing/ (incl. 911 call)

Nov. 19, 2019, Chicago, IL
www.lifenews.com/2019/12/18/planned-parenthood-puts-womans-life-at-risk-trying-to-hide-911-call-after-botched-abortion/ (incl. 911 call)

Nov. 21, 2019, Providence, RI
<https://abortion911.com/ambulance-transport-woman-to-hospital-from-rhode-island-planned-parenthood-as-suspected-tissue-trafficking-there-continues/>

Nov. 21, 2019, St. Louis, MO
www.lifenews.com/2019/12/04/st-louis-planned-parenthood-clinic-hospitalizes-75th-woman-injured-in-botched-abortion/

Dec. 19, 2019, Fairview Heights, IL
www.lifenews.com/2019/12/26/new-planned-parenthood-clinic-injures-woman-in-botched-abortion-just-one-week-after-opening/

65a

APPENDIX B: Correspondence with HHS/CDC

ACLJ
American Center
for Law & Justice

April 30, 2004

Tommy G. Thompson
Secretary
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services
200 Independence Avenue, SW
Washington, DC 20201

Re: Abortion statistics and maternal health

Dear Secretary Thompson:

In the challenges to the federal partial birth abortion statute, as on many other occasions, the proponents of legalized abortion make the claim that abortion is safer for women than childbirth. There is very good reason to believe that this claim is false. However, a fair scientific examination of this claim is hindered by the way the Centers for Disease Control (CDC) maintains its relative maternal mortality statistics.

I am writing to urge your office to direct a reassessment of the pertinent statistical measures. In

short, the HHS should see to it that the American public -- and in particular, women contemplating the choice between abortion and continuing pregnancy -- have a genuine basis for an honest and meaningful comparison of the relative risks. If, in the alternative, the CDC is unable to provide a basis for a true comparison, it should so state.

The CDC has in the past reported maternal mortality as the “[n]umber of maternal deaths per 100,000 live births.” See, e.g., www.cdc.gov/epo/mmwr/preview/mmwrhtml/00054602.htm (Fig. 1, footnote *) (Maternal Mortality -- United States, 1982-1996). Abortion mortality, by contrast, is reported as the number of “[l]egal induced abortion-related deaths per 100,000 reported legal induced abortions.” See, e.g., www.cdc.gov/mmwr/preview/mmwrhtml/ss5212a1.htm (Table 19, footnote *) (Abortion Surveillance -- United States, 2000).

Here are some of the concerns with these statistics:

1. Denominator too small for maternal mortality rate

Maternal mortality should reflect deaths per pregnancy, not deaths per live birth. Stillbirths and miscarriages are fairly common occurrences.¹ To count

¹ See, e.g., www.cdc.gov/nchs/releases/00facts/trends.htm (“6 million-plus pregnancies in 1996 in the U.S. resulted in 3.9 million births, 1.3 million induced abortions and almost a million fetal (continued...)”) (continued...)

maternal deaths associated with miscarriages, for example, while not counting the pregnancies, improperly inflates the maternal mortality rate.²

2. No maternal mortality rate adjustment for gestational stage

The relative risk of aborting versus continuing a pregnancy should reflect the prospective risks only, and not risks associated with stages of pregnancy already passed. For example, ectopic pregnancies cause a significant percentage of maternal deaths, and indeed are the leading cause of deaths in the first trimester. See, e.g., www.cdc.gov/mmwr/preview/mmwrhtml/00035709.htm (Current Trends: Ectopic Pregnancy -- United States, 1990-92). Obviously, a woman entering her second trimester faces zero risk of a first-trimester death from ectopic pregnancy, yet the undifferentiated CDC maternal mortality rate incorporates those first-trimester deaths. An abortion cannot eliminate risks that have already passed; only prospective risks should enter into the comparison.

3. Underreporting of abortion-related deaths

¹ (...continued)
deaths," i.e., "16 percent [ended] in a miscarriage or stillbirth").

² Of course, live births should be counted only once for each labor, regardless of whether the woman bears at one time a single child, twins, triplets, or a greater number.

A true statistical comparison of the risks of death from abortion versus continued pregnancy is impossible if the statistics are inaccurate. Thus, the apparently common failure to report abortion-related deaths see www.afterabortion.org/PAR/V8/n2/abortion-deaths.html (“The Cover-Up: Why U.S. Abortion Mortality Statistics Are Meaningless”), underestimates the abortion mortality rate. The same problem would apply to any underreporting of other maternal deaths. (And, of course, abortion-related deaths must be excluded from the maternal mortality rate if any comparison is to be made. Counting abortion deaths as maternal deaths as well -- or instead -- stacks the deck against childbearing and in favor of abortion.)

4. Disregard of non-immediate deaths

Recent studies indicate that abortion is associated with an increased rate of short-term and long-term maternal death. See www.afterabortion.org/physical.html (“A list of Major Physical Sequelae Related to Abortion”). A fair comparison of abortion with continued childbearing, like a fair comparison of smoking with nonsmoking, would take into account all such statistically significant increased death risks.

* * *

Women choose or decline abortions for many different reasons, and the decision for many may represent a complex balance of multiple considerations. It is a grave disservice to withhold from

69a

women the information needed for a genuine comparison between abortion mortality and the risk of mortality from continuing the pregnancy. Such information may be decisive for many women. Moreover, abortion businesses, which have profit motives for women to choose abortion, cannot be relied upon to present the full picture. Indeed, such businesses may be using statistics -- despite the flaws described above -- to help sell abortion to trusting lay women. Cf. www.abortion.com/questions.html (claiming that “statistically, childbirth is far more dangerous than abortion”).

I strongly urge you to direct the CDC to make all necessary adjustments to its preparation and presentation of statistical data to allow for an honest, unbiased comparison of the relative risks of abortion and continuing pregnancy.

Very truly yours,

/s/

Walter M. Weber
Senior Litigation Counsel

WMW:fd

cc: Timothy Goeglein
Terrell Halaska

70a

DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
& HUMAN SERVICES

Public Health Service
Centers for Disease Control
and Prevention (CDC)
Atlanta, GA 30333

JUL 20 2004

Mr. Walter M. Weber
Senior Litigation Counsel
American Center for Law & Justice
201 Maryland Avenue, N.E.
Washington, D.C. 20002

Dear Mr. Weber:

We appreciate your interest in the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention's (CDC) efforts to collect and publish maternal mortality statistics (including those related to abortion). CDC makes every effort to identify all such deaths and to present maternal mortality statistics using established scientific methods.

The maternal mortality rate is computed as all maternal deaths per 100,000 live births. In contrast, the measure used for abortions is a case-fatality rate which is computed per 100,000 legal abortions. These measures are conceptually different and are used by CDC for different public health purposes.

CDC calculates the maternal mortality rate per 100,000 live births for the following reasons:

1. To maintain comparability in long term trends for the United States. Estimates of the number of pregnancies (including live births, miscarriages or stillbirths, and induced abortions) in the United States have been published only since the 1970s.
2. The live birth component of the pregnancy estimates is highly reliable. Virtually all births are counted in every year. Estimates of all abortions are based on CDC's abortion surveillance system, which relies on state abortion reporting systems. Estimates of stillbirths, ectopic pregnancies, and miscarriages are based on survey data and are subject to significant sampling error, particularly for smaller population subgroups. Estimates of stillbirths and miscarriages are based on pregnancy history data from the National Survey of Family Growth (NSFG). The NSFG is conducted periodically, every 5 to 7 years. The data are subject to sampling error, particularly for smaller population subgroups. For information on the estimation methodology, see www.cdc.gov/nchs/data/series/sr_21/sr21_056.pdf.
3. To maintain international comparability. Many other countries cannot adequately estimate the number of pregnancies,

especially those in which abortion is illegal. Information on miscarriage and stillbirth also varies considerably in completeness. In the interest of international comparability, the World Health Organization has specified that the number of live births should be used for the denominator of the maternal mortality rate.

Adjusting the maternal mortality rate for gestational stage is not statistically feasible, because this requires data that are not currently completely available. The Pregnancy Mortality Surveillance System (PMSS) relies primarily on death certificates which do not typically provide this information. Gestational age may be available for some maternal deaths in cases where linkage with other records (e.g., birth certificates, fetal death reports) is possible. Information on gestational age for induced abortions is available in about 42 states or jurisdictions.

CDC recognizes that despite efforts to count all maternal deaths (including those abortion-related) in the United States, some remain uncounted. The death itself is reported but accurate information on the cause may not be provided. CDC estimates that maternal deaths in general are underreported by 30 to 150 percent (see www.cdc.gov/mmwr/preview/mmwrhtml/ss5202e1.htm). The nature of the surveillance systems make it difficult to obtain complete data. The PMSS compiles data from 50 states, the District of Columbia, and New York City. Abortion surveillance involves

73a

data from 47 states, District of Columbia, and New York City. These systems are voluntary (CDC does not provide remuneration for data) and rely primarily on death certificate data which may or may not provide information that indicates the death was maternal or abortion-related. In the case of deaths associated with induced abortion, CDC also uses searches of computerized print media databases (Lexis-Nexis) to identify additional cases.

At CDC we are very committed to improving data collection systems and providing the most accurate and reliable data on all aspects of maternal and infant health. I hope this information is helpful.

Sincerely,

/s/

Julie Louise Gerberding, M.D., M.P.H.
Director